

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

December 12, 2008

AGENDA ITEM NO.: **1**

Action Requested: APPROVE

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE DISCUSSION AND ACTIONS MEETING OF NOVEMBER 7, 2008

The meeting of the Transportation Committee was called to order by Chair Jim Madaffer (City of San Diego) at 9:03 a.m. See the attached attendance sheet for Transportation Committee member attendance.

1. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

Action: Upon a motion by Vice Chair Jack Dale (East County) and a second by Mayor Lori Holt Pfeiler (North County Inland), the Transportation Committee approved the minutes from the October 17, 2008, meeting.

2. PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS/MEMBER COMMENTS

SANDAG Board of Directors Chair Mary Sessom presented Chair Madaffer with a plaque commemorating his service to the SANDAG Board and the Transportation Committee. Chair Sessom stated that it has been an honor and privilege to work with Chair Madaffer over the years and expressed her appreciation for his service to the region.

Pedro Orso-Delgado, Director Caltrans District 11, presented Chair Madaffer with a Certificate of Appreciation on behalf of Caltrans and thanked him for his support of transportation projects and his leadership for the region.

Chair Madaffer commented that it has been his honor to have served the region and expressed his pleasure for working with SANDAG and Caltrans. He stated that without their support he could not have accomplished what he had over the years. Chair Madaffer stated that our region is strong in transportation issues because of the work done by staff member at SANDAG and Caltrans

Chuck Lungerhausen, a member of the public, submitted written comments and expressed his appreciation to Chair Madaffer for his service. He commented that it has been his pleasure to address the Board and wished the Board members well in their future endeavors.

Clive Richard, a member of the public, stated that it has been a privilege to address this committee and expressed his appreciation to Chair Madaffer for his service.

Jim Schmidt, a member of the public, submitted several articles which he had written regarding the Coastal Commission and its activities. He expressed his concerns regarding the actions of the Coastal Commission and the decisions it has made regarding transportation issues in the region.

Chair Madaffer recognized Councilmember Phil Monroe (South County), Chair Pro Tem Bob Emery (Metropolitan Transit System [MTS]), and Chairman Ed Gallo (North County Transit Service [NCTD]) for their service to their respective jurisdictions and to SANDAG. Chair Madaffer stated that these three gentlemen have been stalwart supporters of transportation to the region and they will be missed. Chair Madaffer expressed his appreciation to Mayor Dave Druker (North County Coastal), Deputy Mayor Jerry Rindone (South County), and Councilmember Toni Atkins (City of San Diego) for their service to the community and the region as well.

Chair Pro Tem Emery stated that seven members of the Transportation Committee will be leaving and urged the member jurisdictions to appoint strong transit and transportation advocates to the Transportation Committee to replace these members. It is very important to bring members to the Committee that understand the needs of the region.

Councilmember Bob Campbell (North County Inland) stated that he recently attended the Lake Arrowhead Symposium on behalf of SANDAG. The Symposium covered climate change issues and was very educational. He had the opportunity to learn what other countries were doing to address climate change and gave examples of some efficiencies from other countries in the areas of transit and transportation.

CONSENT ITEM

3. *TransNet* ROUTINE ACCOMMODATION EXCLUSIONS – CITY OF CHULA VISTA (APPROVE)

The Transportation Committee is asked to approve a request from the City of Chula Vista for exclusion from Board Policy No. 031, *TransNet* Ordinance and Expenditure Plan Rules, Rule #21: Accommodation of Bicyclists and Pedestrians, for five specific roadway projects.

Action: Upon a motion by Chair Pro Tem Emery (Metropolitan Transit System [MTS]) and a second by Councilmember Matt Hall (North County Coastal), the Transportation Committee approved Consent Item 3.

CHAIR'S REPORT

4. STATE ROUTE 905/11 STATUS UPDATE (INFORMATION)

Chair Madaffer stated that he would like to see the Strike Team meetings continue once he is no longer the Chair. He stated thanks to Mr. Orso-Delgado we should have the presidential permit within the next week.

Chair Madaffer expressed his appreciation to Mr. Orso-Delgado and his staff for their work on both State Route (SR) 11 and the new Port of Entry. He commented that as we move forward *TransNet* dollars are down by 4 percent and we need to work with Caltrans to ensure these projects get funding. Chair Madaffer stated that perhaps staff could look into

finding funds that could be swapped to relieve *TransNet* dollars that could be used for other projects in the Region.

Mr. Orso-Delgado stated that he made a site visit to SR 905 and was very impressed with the construction work completed so far and the work currently underway. He commented that in Phase 1A almost 24 percent of the work has been completed in 19 percent of the time. He commented that the community is being very understanding of the project noise and disturbances and there have been very few complaints received. Mr. Orso-Delgado stated that the contractor is in the process of doing underground work flood and building the drainage channel, and the bridge cones are in place. Mr. Orso-Delgado stated that they are currently at trial with a property owner regarding a right-of-way and that he hopes the case will reach resolution within the month. The final right-of-way trial is scheduled for February 2009, and staff believes that the funding allocation is enough to settle all the cases but there is still a risk. Mr. Orso-Delgado stated that Phase 1B went out to bid in October and they expect to break ground in February 2009 which is on schedule.

Mr. Orso-Delgado stated that the legislation for SR 11 passed and the project also is one of three nationwide that was chosen for the federal border congestion relief program, which gives us access to technical, financial, environmental, and right-of-way assistance from both the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) and Department of Transportation (DOT). Mr. Orso-Delgado stated that the Presidential Permit is being processed at the Department of State and they expect that the Undersecretary of State will be briefed early next week and they expect to have the fully executed Presidential Permit within two weeks after that.

Mr. Orso-Delgado stated that he and Gary Gallegos, Executive Director, will be meeting with the Mexican Department of Transportation counterparts to discuss a unitary toll collections system and joint financing for the new Port of Entry. He stated that the staff will internally study potential cross border connections and interchanges and feasibility prior to getting public comments.

Action: This item was presented for information only.

REPORTS

5. 2008 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM: AMENDMENT NO. 1 (APPROVE)

Sookyung Kim, Financial Programming Manager, presented the item. SANDAG processes amendments to the RTIP generally on a quarterly basis and occasionally on a more frequent basis as circumstances arise. The quarterly amendment process usually falls in October of each year.

However, since SANDAG anticipated federal approval of the 2009 Federal State Transportation Improvement Program (FSTIP) which includes the SANDAG 2008 RTIP, to be delayed until the first week of November, the first quarterly amendment was delayed to the this meeting. Ms. Kim stated that Amendment No. 1 includes changes as requested by member agencies and Table 1 provides the project descriptions, proposed changes and funding for projects proposed.

Ms. Kim stated that the ITOC reviewed Amendment No. 1 at its October 15, 2008, meeting focusing its review on the *TransNet* extension funded programs. ITOC members provided comments on three projects: State Route (SR) 76 (CAL29), SPRINTER (NCTD16), and City of Encinitas Traffic Safety Calming (ENC19). The ITOC comments related to SR 76 and the SPRINTER were conveyed to the Transportation Committee at its October 17 meeting and to the Board of Directors at its October 24 meeting. ITOC comments related to these three projects are included in the staff report Attachment 2. Project ENC19 was programmed as a congestion relief project. ITOC members correctly pointed out that traffic safety type projects are considered maintenance based on Rule 18 of Policy No. 031. This change has been made and is reflected in Table 1.

Ms. Kim stated that SANDAG transmitted the draft project amendment to interested parties for a 15-day public review. The comment period ended October 22, 2008. No comments were received.

Ms. Kim reviewed the proposed amendments and the additional information included in Table 1 for the following entities: Caltrans, the City of Encinitas, NCTD, SANDAG, MTS, the City of San Diego, the City of Santee, and the City of San Marcos.

Ms. Kim stated that federal regulations require the 2008 RTIP to be a revenue-constrained document with programmed projects based upon available or committed funding and/or reasonable estimates of future funding. Funding assumptions are generally based upon: (1) authorized or appropriated levels of federal and state funding from current legislation; (2) conservative projections of future federal and state funding based upon a continuation of current funding levels; (3) the most current revenue forecasts for the *TransNet* program; and (4) the planning and programming documents of the local transportation providers. Tables 2a through 2c provide updated program summaries including a comparison from the prior approved version. Based upon the analysis, the projects contained within the 2008 RTIP, including Amendment No. 1, are reasonable when considering available funding sources.

Ms. Kim stated that on July 25, 2008, SANDAG found the 2008 RTIP in conformance with the Regional Air Quality Strategy/State Implementation Plan (SIP) for the San Diego region. All of the required regionally significant capacity increasing projects were included in the quantitative emissions analysis conducted for the *2030 San Diego Regional Transportation Plan: Pathways for the Future* (2030 RTP) and the 2008 RTIP. The 2008 RTIP and its conformity finding have been submitted to the Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) and a determination of conformity is expected early part of November 2008. The FHWA and the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) jointly approved the conformity determination for the 2030 RTP and the conformity re-determination for the 2006 RTIP on December 10, 2007.

Ms. Kim stated that projects in RTIP Amendment No. 1 meet the conformity provisions of the Transportation Conformity Rule (40 CFR §93.122(g)). All capacity increasing projects in Amendment No. 1 were included in the quantitative emissions analysis conducted for the 2030 RTP and 2008 RTIP. All other projects not included in the air quality conformity analysis are either non-capacity increasing or are exempt from the requirement to determine conformity according to the Transportation Conformity Rule (40 CFR §93.126). SANDAG followed interagency consultation procedures to determine which projects are exempt. Amendment No. 1 does not interfere with the timely implementation of Transportation

Control Measures. The 2008 RTIP, including Amendment No. 1, remains in conformance with the SIP.

Action: Upon a motion by Mayor Pfeiler and a second by Supervisor Ron Roberts (County of San Diego), the Transportation Committee adopted Resolution No. 2009-07, approving Amendment No. 1 to the 2008 RTIP.

6. ADOPTION OF MITIGATED NEGATIVE DECLARATION FOR MID-CITY RAPID BUS PROJECT (ADOPT)

Miriam Kirshner, Senior Regional Planner, presented the item. The Mid-City Rapid Bus Project includes the design and implementation of a 10-mile Rapid Bus service between San Diego State University (SDSU) and downtown San Diego along El Cajon and Park Boulevards. The line will provide North Park, City Heights, and College area residents, students, and workers with a limited-stop, high-speed service in one of the key transit corridors in the region. The Rapid Bus project will implement a number of transit priority treatments (for example, signal priority treatments and signal queue jumps) designed to improve transit operations in a mixed-flow traffic setting. The Mid-City Rapid Bus Project is included in the *TransNet* Extension Ordinance and Expenditure Plan approved by the voters in 2004, and is on the Early Action Project list. Funding also is expected from the federal Very Small Starts program.

Ms. Kirshner stated that a draft Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) was prepared for the project and was circulated for a 30-day public review period. The draft MND was available for review at public libraries, on the SANDAG Web site, and in hard copy and disk. The document was distributed to interested parties, to the State Clearinghouse, and to the County Recorder. The MND analyzes potential project impacts related to air quality, cultural resources, hazardous materials, noise, aesthetics, geology and soils, hydrology and water quality, transportation, and utilities. There are mitigation measures for noise, air quality, cultural resources, and hazardous materials.

Ms. Kirshner stated that a number of comments on the draft MND were received. A number of reviewers raised questions about the parking and traffic impacts of the proposed pop-out stations and bus storage pockets. There also were questions about estimated transit travel time and dwell time at the stations. The comments are incorporated into the final MND, with responses, and with changes to the MND where appropriate. After mitigation, there are no remaining significant environmental impacts. The project's impacts to on-street parking are considered not significant environmentally; however, staff would continue to refine the station designs to further reduce parking impacts throughout the final design process.

Ms. Kirshner stated that if the Transportation Committee adopts the final MND, staff also will proceed to prepare final design plans for the project. Adoption of the MND by the Transportation Committee is needed before final design can proceed.

Ms. Kirshner reviewed the activities that will occur during the final design process. Modifications will be made to the station design drawings to reflect changed conditions and community input. In addition, staff will address the issue brought up by the Transportation Committee regarding combining Rapid Bus and local bus stops. The basic shelter concept has undergone community review at previous workshops and the September 11, 2008,

community workshop. Staff anticipates revising the design based on community input and consistency with the Mid-Range Transit Plan (currently underway) that will develop regional guidelines on Bus Rapid Transit project attributes (including stations) to ensure consistency across projects. Staff also will collaborate with MTS to develop a branding design for the articulated buses that will be purchased as part of the Rapid Bus project. Collaboration with MTS on the operating plan that will be funded jointly by *TransNet* and existing MTS resources on Route 15 also will begin. Operating cost estimates will include frequency enhancements to the existing Route 15 service, maintenance of shelters, fare vending equipment, and on-vehicle signal priority equipment. Staff will collaborate with the City of San Diego on issues including station design, traffic control, and monitoring and maintenance of signal priority equipment. This will lead to an agreement on operating costs and responsibilities, including maintenance of travel lanes, drainage facilities, signal timing and phasing, and off-vehicle signal priority equipment. Staff will collaborate with community organizations on maintenance of new landscaping. The stations will provide new street trees. The current plan is to install the landscaping and irrigation, then turn over maintenance responsibilities to existing maintenance districts. Staff will conduct value engineering and revise cost estimates.

Ms. Kirshner stated that the final design process will include a critical evaluation of cost-effectiveness and possible design modifications to add value to the project. Cost estimates will be revised throughout the process. Staff will maintain a tight control on project costs to ensure that SANDAG is in compliance with the requirements of the federal Very Small Starts program.

Councilmember Atkins requested clarification regarding the comment letters and petition received dealing with the parking issues in the 4100-4200 block of Park Boulevard and what action staff took in response.

Ms. Kirshner stated that a number of businesses expressed their concerns regarding the loss of seven on-street parking spaces in the 4200 block resulting from the construction of a station on that block. During a public outreach meeting, it was suggested that the station be relocated to the south side of the intersection. Our engineers did an alternative design and although it simply transfers the loss to the 4100 block, we felt that this was the preferred alternative because there was adequate off-street parking in that block. As a result of that public comment we did change the design on this segment of the corridor which was included in the final MND.

Steve Russell, City Heights Community resident commented that this pilot project is a key part of our community revitalization. This project was intended as a showcase for introducing these types of transit lines in an urban area. SANDAG staff did an excellent job with community outreach and responding to community concerns. He expressed his support for the project.

Clive Richard expressed his support for the project.

Councilmember Atkins expressed her appreciation to staff for their dedication to the community process. She stated that this project was challenging because it was located in an urban community with a business district and sensitive parking issues. She stated that projections show this line as one with the highest ridership and commented that it is critical to the community. Councilmember Atkins expressed her appreciation to staff for their

professionalism and responsiveness in dealing with all the issues of the community. She also expressed her thanks for having this project completed before she left office because it was so important to her constituents in the community.

Mayor Jim Desmond (San Diego County Regional Airport Authority [SDCRAA]) commented that one of the biggest complaints about transit is that it is too complicated or difficult to use and the project make transit easy to use and simple to understand, and he stated his support for the project and his appreciation to staff for their hard work.

Councilmember Monroe commented that this line is projected to have one of the highest riderships and stated that he would like to have a follow up item on an agenda in six months to compare the projected ridership for this line with actual numbers.

Chair Madaffer acknowledged the work of the community members on this project. He stated they have been diligent and worked with SANDAG staff to bring this project forward. He commented that hopefully this will be the first of many of this type of rapid bus line in the region to bring our region closer to meeting the requirements of SB 375 and greenhouse gas emission reduction.

Action: Upon a motion by Councilmember Monroe and a second by Chair Madaffer, the Transportation Committee adopted the Mitigated Negative Declaration for the Mid-City Rapid Bus Project.

7. PUBLIC HEARING: 2008 CONGESTION MANAGEMENT PROGRAM UPDATE (APPROVE)

Heather Werdick, Senior Regional Planner, presented the item. SANDAG is required by state law to prepare and regularly update a Congestion Management Program (CMP) for the San Diego region. The purpose of the CMP is to monitor the performance of the transportation system, develop programs to address near-term and long-term congestion, and better integrate transportation and land use planning. The last CMP update was adopted by SANDAG in 2006.

Ms. Werdick stated that at the September 19 meeting, the Transportation Committee accepted the Draft 2008 CMP Update for distribution and 30-day public comment period, and scheduled a public hearing for today's meeting. Subsequent to this action, copies of the Draft 2008 CMP Update were distributed to SANDAG technical working groups, local jurisdictions, and other interested parties. The Draft CMP also was posted on the SANDAG Web site.

Ms. Werdick stated that the focus of the 2008 CMP Update is to provide an updated CMP roadway network Level of Service (LOS) analysis based on 2007 traffic data, to provide an updated CMP transit corridor analysis based on 2007 transit data, and to provide an analysis of the effect of 2030 RTP improvements on the deficient segments identified in this CMP update.

Ms. Werdick stated that based upon the 2007 data there is a decrease of 15 deficient freeway and conventional highway segments equaling a decrease in deficient mileage of almost 51 miles compared to the 2006 CMP Update. For CMP arterials, there also has been a decrease of 12 deficient segments with deficient mileage declining by almost 16 miles.

Ms. Werdick stated that 11 CMP transit corridors were evaluated in terms of miles of service provided, number of trips operated, ridership, and average bus speed. Between 2005 and 2007, there has been an overall 12.8 percent increase in the number of trips operated, a 9.2 percent increase in ridership, and a 0.8 percent decrease in average vehicle speed.

Ms. Werdick stated that an analysis of CMP-identified roadway deficiencies (segments with LOS F) was conducted to assess the impacts of recommended improvements contained within the 2030 RTP on roadway congestion. Ms. Werdick summarized the results of this analysis and stated that the remaining deficient roadway segments that still require Deficiency Plans or equivalent analysis are included in Attachment 1. As this analysis shows, even with the planned 2030 RTP improvements, there still will be congestion in the future in some corridors. Population and employment growth coupled with future changes in land use and additional planned development make tackling congestion a challenge that should continue to be addressed.

Ms. Werdick stated that under state law, the local jurisdiction or jurisdictions in which the deficiency occurs are responsible for the preparation of Deficiency Plans. The purpose of a Deficiency Plan is to evaluate the cause of the existing roadway deficiency and to propose remedial actions necessary to address the deficiency. As previously discussed, the initial deficiency plan requirements are met through the RTP deficiency analysis. For those remaining deficient roadway segments, SANDAG and Caltrans are available to assist local agencies in preparing individual Deficiency Plans. SANDAG, Caltrans, and local jurisdictions are working on a number of sub-regional and corridor studies that may eliminate the need for specific Deficiency Plans. Corridor System Management Plans are underway for the Interstate 5 (I-5) North and I-805 Corridors in addition to a corridor study for the I-5 South Corridor. Additional travel demand modeling to evaluate the cause of the deficiency also may help address the requirements of Deficiency Plans. SANDAG staff in collaboration with local jurisdictions will develop additional implementation strategies for preparing Deficiency Plans that will be proposed as part of the FY 2010 budget process.

Ms. Werdick stated that the 30-day public comment period ended on October 22, 2008. SANDAG received comments on the Draft 2008 CMP Update from four agencies. The comments focus on minor wording changes, Deficiency Plans, and future additions to the CMP arterial network. Minor corrections and edits will be incorporated into the Final 2008 CMP Update, however, there are no substantive changes proposed for the Final 2008 CMP Update.

Ms. Werdick stated that staff evaluated two strategies for future CMP analysis to determine whether the state CMP process can be conducted on a more cost effective manner, and whether the efficiencies gained would outweigh the policy considerations. One strategy is to streamline the SANDAG CMP process and the other is to opt out of the state CMP process.

Ms. Werdick reviewed the details of the streamlined CMP Approach and stated that the basic state legislative requirements of the CMP are to monitor the performance of the transportation system, develop programs to address near- and long-term congestion, and better integrate transportation and land use planning. Since 1991, SANDAG has addressed these requirements through a CMP document that is updated biennially.

Staff evaluated incorporating the CMP requirements and monitoring into other SANDAG ongoing planning and monitoring activities, such as the Regional Comprehensive Plan (RCP)

Annual Performance Monitoring Report and Intergovernmental Review Program. To continue to follow the state CMP requirements, the Office of General Counsel and staff believe it is not necessary to prepare a stand-alone CMP document in the future.

In order to implement the streamlined approach for the CMP monitoring and reporting process, the RCP Annual Monitoring Report would continue to include CMP deficiency analysis information, but it would be expanded to include the other information that is required to be reported for the CMP. The current public review process for the RCP Annual Monitoring Report could serve as the public review process for the CMP as well. This streamlined approach for state mandated CMP monitoring would be fully incorporated into the 2010 RCP performance monitoring report.

Ms. Werdick stated that the second option, to Opt Out of the state CMP process is allowed by legislation for congestion management agencies. In order to opt out, a majority of the local jurisdictions representing a majority of the population in the county must adopt resolutions electing to be exempt from the state CMP. All six counties in the Sacramento region, as well as Fresno County, have opted out of the state CMP requirement. One major reason to consider opting out of the State CMP process is that under the law, local jurisdictions are responsible for preparing Deficiency Plans for deficient segments. Additionally, the Congestion Management Agency (SANDAG) is required to report a local jurisdiction's failure to prepare and adopt a sufficient Deficiency Plan within the time allowed by statute, and is obligated to provide notification to the state if the local jurisdiction does not meet the statutory deadlines. The state may then withhold state gas tax funds from a local jurisdiction without an adopted Deficiency Plan.

Under the Opt Out option, SANDAG would still comply with federal congestion management provisions; however, this could be done through existing SANDAG planning and performance monitoring activities, such as the RTP.

Ms. Werdick reviewed the table reflecting the benefits and limitations of the state CMP as well as trade-offs of opting out of the state CMP requirement.

At its March 21, 2008, meeting, the Transportation Committee requested that SANDAG staff evaluate whether additional arterials should be added to the CMP network. The following criteria were developed and discussed with the Cities/County Transportation Advisory Committee (CTAC) and the Regional Planning Technical Working Group (TWG) to conduct this evaluation. Currently, there are 11 CMP arterial corridors that are included in the 2008 CMP Update. The criteria are that the arterial must be included in the Regional Arterial System; the arterial must be classified as a principal or prime arterial in the local jurisdiction's circulation element/general plan; the arterial must carry a high volume of traffic (at least 50,000 average daily traffic); the arterial is not near an existing CMP facility (within two miles or within one mile if the arterial has regional transit); and the arterial provides connectivity and regional coverage to the CMP network.

If SANDAG continues to update the state CMP, staff proposes adding the following arterials to the CMP network: Telegraph Canyon Road/Otay Lakes Road: I-805 to SR 125 (City of Chula Vista) and Mira Mesa Boulevard: I-805 to I-15 (City of San Diego).

Ms. Werdick stated that the City of Chula Vista staff concurs with SANDAG staff on the proposed addition of Telegraph Canyon Road. However, City of San Diego staff disagrees

with the criteria used to evaluate new arterials. SANDAG staff modified the criteria based on suggestions from CTAC and staff from the City of San Diego. City of San Diego staff requested additional changes to the criteria, such as a higher threshold of average daily trips, developing a new definition for prime arterials, and an exception for arterials that are located adjacent to or within smart growth areas. SANDAG staff feels the additional proposed changes are not appropriate and could result in a majority of the existing CMP arterials not meeting revised indicators. Therefore, SANDAG staff recommends that both Telegraph Canyon Road/Otay Lakes Road and Mira Mesa Boulevard be added to the CMP network and be included in future CMP updates, should they be continued. New CMP arterials would be required to participate in biennial roadway monitoring and would be subject to the deficiency plan requirements if found deficient.

Based on direction received from the Transportation Committee, staff will bring back further information regarding the options for future CMP updates as outlined above, as well as possible modifications to the CMP arterial network, for action at a future Transportation Committee meeting.

Chair Madaffer opened the public hearing.

Chairman Gallo commented that staff is recommending adding two new arterials to the network. He commented that Bear Valley Parkway in Escondido has two segments located in the unincorporated area and have had no improvements done.

Ms. Werdick stated that Bear Valley Parkway is part of the Regional Arterial System but it does not meet the second criteria because it is not classified as a prime arterial, thus staff is not recommending that it be included.

Mayor Druker requested clarification regarding the deficient segments and that when looking at the 2007 data and applying that to what happens with the 2030 RTP, these segments remain deficient, and Ms. Werdick stated that was correct.

Councilmember Atkins expressed her concerns regarding the practical impact to the City of San Diego and its land use decisions in smart growth areas.

Councilmember Monroe commented that he understood that the local jurisdiction was responsible for the preparation and funding of the deficient segments, and asked if National City would be responsible for the preparation and funding of the deficiency report for the I-5 deficient segment from SR 54 to the Pacific Highway ramp. He commented that this was a burden for local jurisdictions for these major highways and asked if the funding comes from SANDAG or the city's general fund.

Ms. Werdick stated that state guidelines and requirements are that local agencies prepare, fund, and adopt the Deficiency Plans for roadways. At one time there was a Deficiency Plan done for the central I-5 Corridor by the City of San Diego so there is a precedent for that segment.

Bob Leiter, Director of Land Use and Transportation Planning, stated that funding of the Deficiency Plans is a policy and budget issue. SANDAG and Caltrans participate in the development of these plans when it involves state highways. For example, the I-5 South Corridor is deficient and the City of Chula Vista has partnered with SANDAG and Caltrans to

prepare the Deficiency Plan for that corridor. Mr. Leiter stated that it is a shared responsibility to fund and develop the plan. He stated that in this case Chula Vista was able to acquire funds from grants through Safe, Accountable, Flexible, Efficient Transportation Equity Act – A Legacy for Users (SAFETEA-LU) to cover its share of the costs.

Mr. Gallegos commented that Deficiency Plans are an unfunded mandate and it is always a challenge to find sources of funding for these types of state requirements. He stated that working cooperatively, Chula Vista, SANDAG, and Caltrans were able to develop a funding plan and make it work.

Chair Madaffer stated that if a local jurisdiction does not have a congestion management plan, SANDAG cannot send it state gas tax funds.

Ms. Werdick stated that SANDAG is required to adopt a CMP identifying deficient segments, and the local jurisdictions are required to adopt a Deficiency Plan within one year for those segments located in their jurisdiction. SANDAG is required to report to the state which jurisdictions are out of compliance and the state controller could withhold certain portion of the state gas tax.

Chair Madaffer expressed his concern that under the current condition of the state budget the state will be looking for areas that they can withhold payments so this issue is very important to our local jurisdictions.

Patti Boekamp, Director of Engineering and Capital Projects Department, and in charge of traffic engineering operations within the City of San Diego, stated that when the gas tax increase was done there was a requirement to adopt a congestion management plan and that was one of the conditions to receive the gas tax. She expressed her concerns that if SANDAG opts out of the program the state would withhold the gas tax funds. Ms. Boekamp also questioned who set the criteria as to what is considered a prime arterial in the region's congestion management plan. The City of San Diego objects to the definition of prime arterial in the plan for the region. She stated that prime arterials have high amounts of traffic and are protected from having too many driveways and cross streets. She stated the City's main objection is that prime arterials should not be those that bi-sect a smart growth area. She stated that for good smart growth there is high density and focus on pedestrian and transit opportunities. Ms. Boekamp stated the City of San Diego objects to the inclusion of Mira Mesa Boulevard as a prime arterial. She commented that it is shown on the Smart Growth Opportunity maps and would not serve well as a prime arterial.

Chair Madaffer closed the public hearing.

Councilmember Atkins requested staff explain how the criteria are set for designation of prime arterials and the impact on the City of San Diego. She stated that the record needs to reflect the concerns of the City of San Diego.

Ms. Werdick stated that the original legislation did include a penalty for opting out and required that all Congestion Management Agency adopt a CMP but later revisions changed that requirement. There is no longer a penalty to opt out but specific requirements must be met for opting out. Several regions have followed those guidelines and opted out and for that reason staff is bringing that as an option for SANDAG. Ms. Werdick commented that as for who sets the criteria, the state requirements specify a principal or prime arterial and

those are the only guidelines. Staff started with the original criteria from the 1991 CMP and expanded those to include specifics to Bus Rapid Transit and ADT. She stated that smart growth areas were not included. She stated that staff looked at programs other jurisdictions in the state to ensure that our program has similar criteria. Other jurisdictions still require the prime arterial. Staff did not feel it was appropriate to include the smart growth area criteria in the program because ten out of the eleven existing arterials in the smart growth area would not meet the criteria.

Mr. Leiter clarified that the recommendation today is to consider the options to either streamline the process or to opt out of the CMP. Staff is not recommending any action today regarding adding Mira Mesa Boulevard to the program but only asking a discussion of whether to opt out. If we do opt out, we can then look at the other arterials under our own criteria not the state's criteria.

Mr. Gallegos commented that staff is asking the committee members to debate the option to opt out and to have the discussion with their respective councils and staff in their jurisdictions. He stated that those counties that have opted out have not lost any gas tax funds.

Ms. Werdick commented that 13 counties have chosen to opt out and have not lost gas tax funds. These jurisdictions continue to follow the federal requirements as would we should we choose to opt out.

Chair Madaffer requested legal counsel opinion on the issue of opting out.

Julie Wiley, SANDAG Legal Counsel, stated that the process started as a result of looking at streamlining the CMP and in reviewing the statutes found the language regarding opting out. She stated that where the majority of a council approves a resolution deciding to opt out this is a possibility as far as the state CMP but not the federal. Ms. Wiley stated that Ms. Werdick did the research regarding the number of counties that did opt out and the results of opting out but if the Transportation Committee would like her to double check the research she would be happy to do so for the next meeting.

Mayor Desmond commented that the state requirement is that the CMP be prepared and adopted but it does not require the plans to be implemented. He stated that it appears to be a good idea to discuss opting out if we don't do anything with it anyway.

Chairman Gallo questioned whether the state would not be able to withhold gas tax funds if we stay in the state program. He commented that if the state has the opportunity to withhold funds they will.

Ms. Werdick stated that as long as Deficiency Plans are done for those segments that are deficient the state will not withhold gas tax funds.

Chairman Gallo requested that Bear Valley Parkway be included in future discussions regarding inclusion as a prime arterial in the CMP.

Councilmember Hall stated that there are three agencies involved and requested that the three agencies present their comments and opinions to the Transportation Committee as well.

Councilmember Monroe commented that there has been a reduction in number of miles of congested highways in San Diego County and in a number of years after completion of several of our projects it will be even more dramatic a reduction. He commented that any plan with a shelf life but no a real life still costs money and we should consider that. Councilmember Monroe commented that smart growth and congestion relief do clash. He stated that if we consider smart growth as a criterion ten of eleven areas would clash with strategies that we want to implement.

Mr. Gallegos stated that we need to determine how to fix the deficiency and make a smart growth area work better. The two strategies don't necessarily clash; we need to determine options to make both work.

Councilmember Monroe stated that the way to make smart growth areas work is to have good transit and make those areas inconvenient for traffic. He commented that the segment from SR 75 Toll Plaza to I-5 North should include the City of San Diego in any partnership for Deficiency Plans and stated that the congestion is from the Toll Plaza to Orange Avenue in Coronado. He stated that the definition either needs to be amended or the City of San Diego included.

Councilmember Atkins asked staff to meet with Ms. Boekamp and address the comments and concerns brought forward today directly with her so she can brief the elected representatives in detail and the San Diego City Council will then be able to discuss this issue and make good policy decisions. She commented that once an arterial is added to the CMP it can't be removed and she would like this committee to have much more discussion on the issue, and for Ms. Boekamp to be completely informed on all impacts to the City of San Diego.

Mr. Leiter stated that regarding the relationship between smart growth and Mira Mesa Boulevard the points brought up today have been discussed. He stated that his staff has been meeting with city staff and suggested that in addition to Ms. Boekamp, city planners should also meet with his staff. He stated that there are examples of arterials that have smart growth adjacent and through good site design are able to accommodate high frequency regional transit.

Mayor Druker stated his support is discussing the option to opt out and to designating Mira Mesa Boulevard as a prime arterial. He stated it is the main route into Sorrento Valley, the region's main employment area and congestion needs to be resolved in that area.

Chair Madaffer stated that part of the action behind the public hearing today is to encourage the member jurisdiction to discuss this issue with their staff and councils.

Ms. Werdick stated that SANDAG staff has already met with CTAC, which is Public Works Directors and with Planning Directors in the Technical Working Group, several times and will also meet with these groups in early December.

Action: Upon a motion by Councilmember Hall and a second by Chairman Gallo, the Transportation Committee conducted a public hearing on the Draft 2008 CMP Update, and following consideration of public testimony, approved the 2008 CMP Update. The Transportation Committee also discussed the options outlined in this report for future CMP

updates and possible modifications to the CMP arterial network, and provided direction to staff on these matters for further consideration at a future Transportation Committee meeting.

8. SECOND READING AND ADOPTION OF PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO REGIONAL COMPREHENSIVE FARE ORDINANCE REGARDING REVENUE SHARING FOR REGIONAL DAY PASSES (HOLD SECOND READING AND ADOPT)

John Kirk, SANDAG Deputy Counsel read the title of the Proposed Amendments to the Regional Comprehensive Fare Ordinance regarding Revenue Sharing for Regional Day Passes into the record.

Action: Upon a motion by Mayor Pfeiler and a second by Chairman Gallo, the Transportation Committee waived the second reading of proposed amendments to the Regional Comprehensive Fare Ordinance that would implement a new revenue sharing formula for Regional Day Passes.

Dan Levy, Senior Regional Planner, presented the item and stated that in June 2008, the Board of Directors gave a second and final reading to amendments to the Regional Comprehensive Fare Ordinance (Fare Ordinance) that included eliminating the NCTD Adult Day Pass and replacing it with the Regional Day Pass. Implementation of this change is scheduled for January 1, 2009. This June 2008 amendment was approved contingent upon a new revenue sharing agreement being in place between SANDAG and the transit operators concerning day pass sales by October 2008. Staffs from NCTD, MTS, and SANDAG have now reached agreement on a proposed revenue sharing formula for Regional Day Passes. The First Reading of the proposed amendments to the Fare Ordinance was held on October 17, 2008.

Mr. Levy stated that the revenue sharing agreements are detailed in Exhibit 1 to the Fare Ordinance, the affected portion of which is included as Attachment 1 to the report today. The proposed amendments add new language to the portion of the Fare Ordinance entitled "REGULAR AND PREMIUM REGIONAL DAY PASS REVENUE ALLOCATION FORMULA." Attachment 1 contains only the portion of the Fare Ordinance that is being amended; all other portions of the Fare Ordinance will be unaffected by the proposed amendments. The proposed amendments would go into effect on January 1, 2009, and would apply only to paper pass sales. The amendments allow each transit operator to retain all revenue from Regional Day Passes sold in their district and used exclusively on their vehicles. At the same time, revenue will be shared equally for passes purchased on one system and used on the other system, but only if the number of passes favors one district by 10 percent, and at least 25 passes. Based on surveys conducted in June and September of 2008, the number of passes sold in each district and used in the other district is virtually in balance at this time, and no revenue sharing is required. SANDAG will repeat the survey annually to determine if the new revenue sharing provisions are triggered.

Mr. Levy stated that the proposed amendments include an expiration date of June 30, 2011, or sooner if the Fare Ordinance is revised to adopt any new revenue sharing recommendations stemming from the regional fare study, a draft of which is scheduled to be discussed at the Transportation Committee meeting on December 12, 2008. It should be noted that Regional Day Passes are issued primarily on paper from bus fare boxes and ticket vending machines. Regional Day Passes include a magnetic strip; however, the technology

does not permit tracking of where the Day Passes are being used, only where they are sold. As a result, SANDAG will conduct an annual survey to determine if the number of passes being used to cross district boundaries is in balance, or if revenue sharing is required. The cost to conduct the survey is about \$2,000, which will be shared equitably between SANDAG and the transit operators.

Action: Upon a motion by Vice Chair Dale and a second by Chair Pro Tem Emery, the Transportation Committee adopted proposed amendments to the Regional Comprehensive Fare Ordinance in substantially the same form as Attachment 1 that would implement a new revenue sharing formula for Regional Day Passes.

9. UTC TRANSIT CENTER FUNDING (RECOMMEND)

Susan Brown, Financial Manager of Programming, presented the item. The San Diego City Council recently approved redevelopment plans for the Westfield Shoppingtown University Towne Centre (UTC) which includes construction of a new transit center. SANDAG staff worked with Westfield, City of San Diego, and MTS staff to ensure that the conceptual design of the new transit center meets the needs of existing and future local and express bus services as well as future bus rapid transit (BRT) services. The proposed Mid-Coast Corridor Transit Project LRT station is located adjacent to the new transit center and was designed at the conceptual level to ensure that once constructed the LRT station would function as an integral part of the transit center. Westfield, the developer, and the City of San Diego have each committed to funding a portion of the \$22 million cost of the bus transit center. SANDAG staff has committed to explore opportunities to fund a share of the cost of the bus transit center.

Ms. Brown stated that the UTC revitalization project is a phased renovation and expansion of the existing regional shopping center. The project includes adding up to 750,000 square feet of retail space and up to 300 multi-family homes. In support of public transit, the project includes a relocated and expanded new bus transit center. As stated above, the new transit center will accommodate existing and future bus services and was designed at the conceptual level to ensure that once constructed the LRT station would function as an integral part of the transit center. The Westfield project also will include direct pedestrian links between UTC Shoppingtown and nearby residential and commercial development.

Ms. Brown stated that Attachment 1 of the report presents a conceptual plan for the new transit center as well as the proposed LRT alignment and station and Attachment 2 presents a rendering of the new transit center.

Ms. Brown stated that development of the Nobel Drive Station has been on hold leaving in excess of \$5.7 million in a 2001 federal grant funds unspent. In the current climate of scarce resources, experience has shown that grants for projects that show no progress for an extended duration are vulnerable to potential de-obligation by the granting agency. If approved by FTA, using the Nobel Drive COASTER Station funds for this UTC Transit Center would help protect these federal funds and put them to work for the region serving the Mid-Coast area for which the funds were originally appropriated.

Mayor Druker stated his support of the action and asked staff if the Nobel Station would not be built if these funds were moved to the UTC Transit Center project, and Ms. Brown

stated that the project would only be delayed and staff would attempt to find other funding sources for the Nobel Station.

Mayor Druker stated that NCTD does not want the Nobel Station to be built because of the impact to the COASTER operations but the employers in that area support the station. He stated that he would like to see an alternative solution to the Nobel Station such as a better transit system that would not need the station.

Action: Upon a motion by Vice Chair Dale, and a second by Councilmember Monroe, the Transportation Committee recommended that the SANDAG Board of Directors direct staff to take the necessary programming actions, including obtaining approval from the Federal Transit Administration, to utilize approximately \$5.7 million in Section 5309 New Starts funds currently programmed for the Nobel Drive COASTER Station as a contribution towards construction of the new bus transit center.

11. UPDATE ON PLANNING FOR I-15 BRT STATIONS AT EL CAJON BOULEVARD AND UNIVERSITY AVENUE (INFORMATION)

Chair Madaffer recognized Councilmember Atkins for her efforts on this project and her role as Chair of the Community Working Group.

Councilmember Atkins stated that she was proud of the work done by the working group and staff in designing alternatives to the BRT stations. She commented that with the support of SANDAG staff, the working group has developed four alternatives to present to Caltrans for further engineering and design work. She acknowledged several members of the working group and the community for their advocacy and work on the project. Councilmember Atkins expressed her thanks to SANDAG staff for their proactive stewardship and their ability to provide the necessary information and direction to the working group. She also expressed her thanks to Councilmember Monroe for attending the first community meeting and to Deputy Mayor Rindone and Chair Pro Tem Emery for their work in talking with members of the community. Councilmember Atkins stated that the partnership has been successful and urged continued support for the project and commented that this project would not have been successful without the support of the Transportation Committee.

Barrow Emerson, Senior Regional Planner presented the item. Over the last year, SANDAG, Caltrans, MTS, and City of San Diego staff have worked with a community working group selected by Councilmember Toni Atkins to develop and evaluate station concepts at El Cajon Boulevard and University Avenue for the planned I-15 BRT service. An earlier design was deemed infeasible due to operational issues. The result of this joint work effort has been the identification of four alternatives that are both geometrically viable from a construction standpoint and are supported by the community working group. The next step will be to carry these station alternatives into the next phase of project development (preliminary engineering and environmental analysis) that is expected to result in a recommended preferred station design by 2010.

Mr. Emerson stated that the Mid-City community's interest in the project dates back to the early planning efforts for the freeway and BRT project, memorialized in agreement between the City and Caltrans in the mid-1990s. The planned transit stations would address two key community issues: increased transit access to employment centers in Kearny Mesa,

University City, and Sorrento Mesa; and the impetus they see it providing for urban development on the freeway bridge decks and surrounding areas.

Mr. Emerson stated that the community working group and staff from the four agencies worked in tandem to develop a wide range of conceptual design options, created performance criteria, and then analyzed and evaluated the alternatives based on how well they addressed the various issues contained in the performance criteria. Based on this evaluation, four geometrically viable alternatives were identified for further detailed evaluation in preliminary engineering and environmental analysis. There is no preferred alternative at this point. Mr. Emerson reviewed the four alternatives as shown in Attachment 2 to the report.

Mr. Emerson stated that Alternative One is the Median Station with Grade Separated Crossover Access and Center Platform. This alternative is similar to the earlier preferred median station design with a center-loading platform; the safety concerns about the earlier bus crossover feature (needed to allow for buses to load from right-hand doors given the center loading passenger platform) would be resolved through a grade separated crossover ramp design. Access to local bus services on the bridge decks would be achieved via stairwells and elevators. Dedicated median bus lanes from I-8 to State Route 94 (SR 94) would maximize bus speeds through the project corridor.

Mr. Emerson stated that the second alternative is the Median Station with Side Platforms. This alternative is a variation of the previous alternative but has side passenger platforms that avoid the need for the bus crossover. Because of right-of-way constraints in the median, the locations of the side platforms would be staggered. This alternative would also have stairwell and elevator access to the bridge decks above, along with dedicated median bus lanes to maximize bus operating speeds.

Mr. Emerson stated that the third alternative is the Shoulder Lane Station. This alternative would locate stations along the freeway shoulder lanes directly underneath the bridge decks, with stairwell and elevator access up to the bridge decks. Freeway transit lanes located in the existing shoulder lanes between I-8 and SR 94 would create low-speed bypasses when the main lanes are congested. This alternative also would allow the creation of BRT stations at Adams Avenue, which is served by MTS Route 11.

Mr. Emerson stated that the Alternative Four is Ramp Stations. This alternative is a variation of the existing freeway ramp stops, but would create larger stations to accommodate the expected I-15 BRT demand through stations located on the freeway on-ramps. Signal priority treatments and freeway shoulder lanes as congestion bypasses would help improve travel speeds. Like the previous alternative, BRT stations at Adams Avenue could be created with this alternative.

Mr. Emerson stated that the next step is to develop preliminary engineering design, determine environmental impacts, and establish capital and operating costs for each alternative with the intent of clearing alternatives environmentally and selecting a preferred alternative. Work on this next phase will begin this month and is scheduled for completion in 2010.

Mr. Emerson stated that each of the project partners has specific areas of interest and in the next stage of analysis these will be investigated to help determine a preferred alternative.

Mr. Emerson reviewed the list of stakeholders and discussed their areas of interest and stated that staff will continue to provide the Transportation Committee with periodic updates on the Mid-City BRT station planning.

Steve Russell, member of the Community Working Group thanked the Transportation Committee for their support and stated that he was present to provide the community perspective. He stated that the work is far from done but the presentation today reflects great progress over the past year. He commented that the community was at odds with Caltrans and now we have four viable options for Caltrans to consider. Mr. Russell commented that this is a great example of how this agency serves the community. He stated that there is still critical future work to determine which option is best. Other concerns regarding funding shortages and future development and land use issues still need to be addressed. He stated that the Working Group is working with the City to work through these issues and stay engaged. Through the partnership with the County, MTS and Caltrans, this project will be part of the region-wide transit system and we look forward to being a part of that. He expressed his appreciation to staff and to Chair Madaffer and the Committee members for their support. He commented that Supervisor Roberts has been a strong advocate and expressed his thanks to Councilmember Atkins for her support and leadership.

Mr. Gallegos stated that through this partnership we have made tremendous progress in getting to four alternatives and there is still work ahead to find the best alternative and the funding for it. He stated that SANDAG staff will continue to work with the community and that this is great model for other opportunities to do the same for other projects. Mr. Gallegos thanked Mr. Russell for his work with the project.

Councilmember Monroe expressed his thanks to those involved in the project and stated that the first community meeting stated with a broken promise to the community but now it feels as though we are restoring that promise and getting the community's support.

Clive Richard, a member of the public, stated that he attended the original community meeting a year ago and that staff and others did an excellent job with expressing to the community that something would be accomplished. He stated that the agency went from being the enemy to being a strong ally and he hopes that other opportunities will be viewed and approached the same way. He commented that you can get more done working together than at odds.

Chair Pro Tem Emery commented that he went on a tour of the area and is impressed with how high hopes could be returned and that the community cooperative attitude was impressive. He stated this is a good example of doing more by working together.

Chair Madaffer expressed his appreciation for the work done on the project by the working group and staff and his hopes of continued cooperation on the project.

Action: This item was presented for information only.

10. COMPASS CARD CAPITAL BUDGET AMENDMENT (APPROVE)

James Dreisbach-Towle, Systems Integration presented the item. The Compass Card is preparing to launch to the general public in January 2009 and will eliminate all paper

monthly passes by July 1, 2009. The final capital improvement still under construction is the installation of remaining rail platform Compass Card Validators (validators). The platform validators will be used by patrons to "tap on" before boarding the Trolley, COASTER, or SPRINTER and will act as a virtual gate. Completion of this work and the reprogramming of the Trolley Ticket Vending Machines (TVMs) to support the Fare Ordinance require an amendment to the capital budget.

Mr. Dreisbach-Towle stated that the original engineer's estimate for installation of the validators was \$1.2 million. To date validators have been installed on the COASTER line, SPRINTER line, and the Trolley Green Line with the remaining work to be performed on the Trolley Orange and Blue Lines. The previous estimate to complete these two lines was \$600,000. In October 2007, SANDAG began negotiating with an electrical contractor under our Job Order Contract (JOC). In April 2008, that contractor was not making the anticipated progress necessary to complete the work in time to begin full operations by January 2009. In order to accelerate the completion of this work, SANDAG staff executed a time and materials contract with one prime contractor and five electrical subcontracts.

Mr. Dreisbach-Towle stated that work commenced again in August 2008; however, SANDAG staff has revised the estimate to complete remaining stations, increasing it from \$600,000 to \$970,000. The estimate to complete was increased due to several factors including an increase in the amount of concrete work, the existing condition of electrical and communication conduits, and the need for additional underground work.

Mr. Dreisbach-Towle stated that in addition to the validator installation work, MTS requested SANDAG to execute an amendment to the existing SANDAG contract with Cubic Transportations Systems, Inc. for reprogramming of TVMs. This additional work is to support a flat Trolley fare and simplification of the TVM menus/screens. The estimate for this work is \$127,904 and will be funded from two MTS capital projects and is detailed in the attached Memorandum of Understanding (MOU). The MOU has been approved by the MTS Board of Directors at its October 30, 2008, meeting.

Mr. Dreisbach-Towle stated that SANDAG staff has put together a budget plan to meet the total increased budget need of \$497,904 (validators - \$370,000 and TVM programming - \$127,904). The budget needs would be met through the Transportation Committee's approval of: (1) the allocation of interest revenue earned on the investments of bond proceeds in the amount of \$200,000; and (2) the MOU with MTS to transfer funds in the amount of \$127,904. Additional actions by (1) the Executive Director, under Policy No. 017, authorized the transfer of \$100,000 of project funds from savings in the Regional Transit Management System (RTMS) (CIP Project No.1094000); and (2) pending action by the SANDAG Executive Committee would authorize the allocation of SANDAG Contingency Reserves in the amount of \$70,000 to complete the funding plan.

Action: Upon a motion by Mayor Pfeiler and a second by Councilmember Hall, the Transportation Committee amended the Automated Fare Collection Project (CIP Project No. 1145700) budget for the installation of rail station Compass Card validators and reprogramming of ticket vending machines by \$327,904 through: (1) the allocation of \$200,000 in interest earned on the project's bond deposit; and (2) authorizing the Executive Director to execute the Memorandum of Understanding with Metropolitan Transit System in substantially the same form as Attachment 1 with terms including the transfer of \$127,904 from MTS to SANDAG. Additional actions by the Executive Director

and possible action by the Executive Committee totaling \$170,000 will result in an aggregate budget increase of \$497,904 to the project.

12. REVISION TO FY 2009 TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT AND *TransNet* REVENUES (RECOMMEND)

Ms. Kim presented the item. The transit operators within the SANDAG region receive various federal, state, and local revenues to support both ongoing operations and capital projects. The Transportation Development Act (TDA) and *TransNet* are two of the major sources of funding for NCTD and MTS. Unfortunately, the San Diego region continues to experience downward trends in sales tax revenues from which these two vital sources of revenues are derived. FY 2008 *TransNet* receipts were 1.4 percent lower than FY 2007. Although receipts for the quarter just ended are not available yet, it is clear that the decline is continuing. Accordingly, a revision is proposed to reduce the FY 2009 revenue estimates for TDA and *TransNet* from the amount approved by the Board of Directors in February 2008. Ms. Kim stated that she would review those numbers but first Marney Cox, Chief Economist would discuss the current economic conditions and how that affects sales tax revenues.

Mr. Cox stated that SANDAG has developed an economic model that has historically had a 98.9 percent accuracy rating in good economic conditions. He stated that in the 1990s the region had decline in sales receipts and used that as a reasonable guidepost for the coming year. Mr. Cox stated that although conditions are not as bad now as then, we anticipate the conditions to worsen and the consensus forecast is that things will get worse not better. He stated that his staff receives and reviews new information quarterly and will brief quarterly with any changes in the forecast. Mr. Cox stated that the SANDAG forecast is conservative with a 4.6 percent decline but that still causes major funding problems with the transit agencies' operating budgets.

Mr. Cox stated that San Diego's economy, like many regions across the nation, has been impacted by the increasingly global economic slowdown. Nationwide, employment is down more than 750,000 jobs with losses occurring in each month during the year through September 2008, the latest information available. Over the same time period (January 2008 through September 2008), the San Diego region recorded an increase of 5,500 jobs; however, the number of jobs has not risen each month during the year, month to month declines were recorded during the first quarter of 2008 as well as during September. A similar trend has occurred when viewed on a year over year basis; employment is up 3,900 jobs between September 2007 and September 2008 with some months on a year over year basis showing declines.

Mr. Cox stated that although most of the weakness, both locally and nationwide over the past two years, has been in the construction and financial activities sectors, a noteworthy trend in San Diego has been the stability in the construction sector that has emerged since the beginning of 2008. The number of workers in construction during September 2008 was at about the same level as it was in January (80,000 workers). The employment trend for financial activities was slightly less stable during 2008 with 1,100 fewer jobs (down 1.5 percent) in this sector during September than recorded at the start of 2008. Overall, the employment trends for these two sectors during 2008 is very encouraging and significantly different than what has happened nationwide with both sectors continuing to decline each month.

Mr. Cox stated that although the number of persons employed in the San Diego region is up over the past year, the job growth has not been sufficient to keep the unemployment rate in check. The region's unemployment rate increased to 6.4 percent in September 2008 from 4.8 percent recorded one year ago and 5.0 percent recorded in January 2008. The local unemployment rate is slightly higher than the national rate of 6.0 percent recorded during September.

Mr. Cox stated that consumer expenditures nationwide were weak going into the third quarter of calendar year 2008 and early indications suggest expenditures may have fallen more than 2 percent during the third quarter. The downturn in consumer expenditures nationwide has been made worse by the deepening financial crises, as credit availability to finance major purchases is tightening. The automobile market has been hit especially hard; sales of light vehicles have fallen to a 16 year low, down 19 percent over the year. Consumer spending for home furnishings is down because of the housing market weakness. More recently consumers are spending less for clothes, personal care, and restaurant dining as consumer confidence shrinks. Similar trends are emerging in San Diego.

Mr. Cox stated that sales tax receipts received by the Regional Transportation Commission declined by 1.42 percent during fiscal year 2008. The sector hit hardest by the slowdown has been construction with sales tax receipts declining 13.7 percent on a year over year basis, using the last quarter of fiscal year 2008 and comparing it against the same quarter for the previous year.

A second area of weakness locally as well as nationally is auto sales. Sales tax receipts from new auto sales declined 11.2 percent during the final quarter of fiscal year 2008 compared to the same quarter for the previous year. A noteworthy trend that exemplifies the diversity of our local economy is the increase in sales tax receipts for restaurants, the regions largest sales tax segment (1.8 percent increase for the second calendar quarter of 2008 compared to the prior year).

Mr. Cox stated that there seems to be a growing consensus nationwide that the current economic slowdown will significantly impact the third and fourth quarter of 2008 and all of 2009. In light of these expected trends SANDAG is projecting a 4.0 percent decline in sales tax revenues during fiscal year 2009, with much of the weakness occurring during last quarter of 2008 and the first two quarters of 2009. The national and local economies are not expected to fully recover from the downturn until 2011 while the transition to more normal rates of revenue growth may take three years (2013). SANDAG is expecting our sales tax revenue to follow a similar path.

Ms. Kim stated that the TDA is the major subsidy source that supports the region's public transit operators and non-motorized transportation projects. The TDA comes from ¼ percent of state sales tax assessed in the region. SANDAG, as the Regional Transportation Planning Agency (RTPA), is responsible for the apportionment of TDA funds each year in conformance with legislative priorities. The transit operators and other member agencies submit their annual TDA claims based on these apportionments and in compliance with the SANDAG TDA Administration Policy (Board Policy No. 027).

Ms. Kim stated that the Board of Directors approved to apportion \$119.7 million of TDA funds for FY 2009 which was provided by the County of San Diego Auditor and Controller

Office in cooperation with SANDAG. The County is statutorily responsible for the apportionment for TDA. SANDAG again has been conferring with the County Auditor's office regarding this latest revision. Based on the latest information available, SANDAG proposes to reduce this to \$113.8 million which equates to a 4.96 percent decline from the initial apportionment. Attachment 1 provides a breakdown of the different programs with TDA that are affected.

Ms. Kim stated that the *TransNet* half-cent sales tax approved by the voters of San Diego County includes the Transit System Improvements (16.5 percent) funding from which the transit revenues are derived. Within the transit share, services provided pursuant to Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) and subsidies for seniors have specific earmarks (2.5 percent and 3.25 percent, respectively). The remaining revenues can be used for operating or miscellaneous capital purposes.

Ms. Kim stated that the Board of Directors previously approved a *TransNet* allocation of \$39.3 million for FY 2009. Based on the latest information available, SANDAG proposes to reduce this to \$37.5 million which equates to a 4.63 percent decline. Mr. Cox/Ms. Kim reviewed Attachment 2 which provided the breakdown of the distribution of the program. Also, as an informational item, the table included the impact to the SANDAG Overall Work Plan as well as the *TransNet*-Major Corridor program which funds all of the Board-adopted Early Action Program projects.

Ms. Kim stated that approval of the revised TDA and *TransNet* estimates will provide the transit operators, SANDAG, and FACT, community transit service provider, with sufficient time to revise their budgets for the remainder of the fiscal year. Staff will continue to monitor the receipts as well as regionwide and nationwide trends and will provide monthly updates to the Board of Directors.

Councilmember Hall referred to the chart on page two of the staff report which shows projected growth rates for *TransNet* sales tax receipts through 2013 and requested clarification regarding the 6 percent projected change from 2009 to 2010.

Mr. Cox stated that the 2 percent increase is based on the new base so the numbers still reflect a loss of 2 percent overall.

Mayor Druker requested clarification regarding the projection of positive 2 percent in 2010 if the region is not expected to recover from the recession until 2011.

Mr. Cox stated that the projections show a negative decline for three quarters in a row during 2008 and 2009. Growth begins in the second quarter of 2009 and at that time there would be a positive growth rate which is not reflected in the projections until 2010. Mr. Cox stated that other projections reflect even worse estimates but the current consensus forecast is what is reflected in these projections and he feels it is the most accurate.

Paul Jablonski, MTS Chief Executive Officer, stated for MTS the sales tax revenue loss already projected for this current year is \$5 million. The projection based on current state budget discussions is taking that loss to closer to \$15 million.

Ray Patchett, NCTD Interim Executive Director, stated that NCTD also is facing extremely high loss of sales tax revenues which will negatively impact services and operations.

Chair Madaffer stated that although this is very bad news to the transit agencies, it is good to know that SANDAG is keeping them fully informed.

Councilmember Hall stated that the SPRINTER was subsidized with federal funds and asked when NCTD would lose that subsidy and have to take over that funding.

Mr. Patchett stated that NCTD would lose the federal subsidy in 2010 and be responsible for \$4 to 5 million in funding for the SPRINTER.

Mr. Gallegos stated that the Governor and the legislators are still debating the current proposal by the Governor and our legislators are pushing hard for continued transit funding and our doing their best to protect funding for the region. He stated that funding of transit agency operations is already at a crisis and any more takeaways would have severe impacts.

Mayor Druker stated that the state is going to continue to raid transit funding and the situation is only going to get worse. He stated that the transit agencies need to find a way to fund transit operations internally so we don't have to rely so heavily on the state.

Harry Mathis, MTS Chairman, stated that high gas prices caused many people to ride transit and unless we can meet their needs we will lose those riders. He stated that transit needs to be competitive in costs and service to keep ridership high.

Supervisor Roberts stated that at a time when the state is requiring a push for public transit and transportation options to help reduce greenhouse gases and protect the environment the state continues to raid the funding necessary for public transportation.

Action: Upon a motion by Councilmember Hall and a second by Chair Pro Tem Emery, the Transportation Committee recommended that the SANDAG Board of Directors: (1) approve the revised FY 2009 Transportation Development Act allocation to \$113.8 million, which equates to a 4.96 percent decline; and (2) approve the revised FY 2009 *TransNet* allocation to \$37.5 million, which equates to a 4.63 percent decline.

13. SAN DIEGO REGIONAL BICYCLE PLAN PROGRESS REPORT (DISCUSSION)

Chris Kluth, Associate Regional Planner, presented the item. The San Diego Regional Bicycle Plan (Plan) is being developed to support implementation of the both the Regional Comprehensive Plan (RCP) and Regional Transportation Plan (RTP). The RCP calls for more transportation options and a balanced regional transportation system to support smart growth and a more sustainable region. The RTP calls for a multi-modal regional transportation network that includes a regional bicycle network. In addition, bicycle transportation plays a role in public health, reducing vehicle miles traveled (VMT), improving air quality, and lessening the dependence on motor vehicle travel.

Mr. Kluth stated that last fiscal year SANDAG was awarded a Caltrans planning grant to prepare a regional bicycle plan. In April 2008, Alta Planning and Design was selected as the consultant to assist SANDAG with the planning project. The Regional Bicycle and Pedestrian Working Group (BPWG) has been identified as the technical advisory committee for the project and the Regional Planning Technical Working Group (TWG) along with the Cities/County Transportation Advisory Committee (CTAC) have been asked to provide input.

Mr. Kluth stated that the main purpose of the Plan is to develop a unified bicycle system throughout the San Diego region that serves a wide variety of bicycle trips with connections to pedestrian paths, trails, and transit. The Plan will define a network of regionally significant bicycle routes, facilities, and necessary support programs and facilities; identify gaps in the network and recommend specific improvements needed to fill these gaps in the system; develop cost estimates for build-out of the entire regional network; develop a funding strategy to implement the regional bike network; identify programs to help local jurisdictions to become more bicycle friendly; and recommend a series of policies and actions to encourage and increase bicycling at the local and regional level.

Mr. Kluth stated that the planning process includes an important public involvement component as well as strong technical elements and has been organized into four phases. The first three phases have focused on the network development. The fourth and final phase will focus on the development of bicycle supportive programs and a funding strategy to implement the Plan.

Mr. Kluth stated that Phase One is the initial work on the Plan which began in April 2008 and included: gathering existing data from SANDAG, local circulation elements, and local bicycle master plans; conducting first set of public workshops to discuss preliminary plan goals and objectives, existing Regional Bikeway Corridors Map , detailed corridor maps, and bicycle crash data; launching project Web site (www.sandag.org/bicycleplan); and collecting data from 1,577 rider preference questionnaires regarding riding behavior, facility preferences, facility deficiencies, and awareness of bicycle-supportive programs.

Mr. Kluth stated that that Phase Two of the project focused on data collection and analysis to draft the existing conditions report. The full Draft Existing Conditions Report has been posted to the project Web site and presents a summary of existing bicycling conditions, facilities, programs, and policies in the San Diego region, as well as a preliminary assessment of the region in terms of relative priority for bicycle improvements.

Mr. Kluth stated that the third phase of the Plan is currently underway and focuses on identifying options toward meeting the diverse needs of existing and future bicyclists. The Proposed Corridor Alignments and Classifications & Regional Bicycle-Related Programs Report has been drafted for public review and provides a summary of further refinement to the regional network, facility types, facility classifications, and bicycle programs. This document has been posted to the project Web site and was presented to the public in a second set of workshops in October 2008.

Mr. Kluth stated that Phase Four is the final phase of the Plan and will include development of goals and objectives, development of bicycle design guidelines and standards for regional facilities, further refinement of the regional network and facility types, preliminary analysis and cost estimates for the priority projects, and development of short-term and long-term funding strategy.

Mr. Kluth stated that in order to develop the existing conditions report and refined regional network, rider preference questionnaires completed in Phase One provided extensive data regarding riding behavior, facility preferences, facility deficiencies, and awareness of bicycle support programs. The data was collected through a questionnaire that was distributed to participants at the public workshops and posted on the project Web site. Between the

workshops and the project Web site, 1,577 surveys were completed. The data illustrates that riding behaviors and facility preferences vary broadly.

When asked why they ride the majority of respondents (90.0 percent) are motivated to bike due to the health benefits associated with biking. The pleasure of riding a bicycle also is an incentive for 81.3 percent of respondents. Transportation-related purposes were cited less frequently by survey respondents with 58.2 percent biking to get to work, 36.6 percent for shopping or running errands, 15.2 percent to connect to transit, and 9 percent to travel to school. Response frequencies do not sum to 100 percent because survey respondents were allowed to select multiple responses.

The greatest number of respondents is most interested in riding on separated bikes paths (71 percent), then on on-street bike lanes (42.6 percent), and thirdly, on bicycle boulevards (41.9 percent) which are shared roadway facilities on local and neighborhood streets that favor through bicycle travel. Fewer respondents favor bike routes, which are defined as shared roadway facilities that are delineated only with signage and no pavement markings. The highest percent (34.6 percent) of respondents ranked bike routes second on a scale from one to four with one being most preferred. Trails or dirt paths are least preferred; with 36.9 percent responding that they are not at all interested in riding on this type of facility. Overall, these results indicate a preference for urban facilities that provide for separate bicycling rights-of-way, or secondarily, on-street lanes.

The survey asked community members about those improvements that most likely would influence increased riding. More bike lanes (Class II) and more multi-use paths (Class I) were mentioned as being very likely to encourage increased riding by over 60 percent of the respondents. Maintenance and wider shoulders were mentioned as being very likely to increase riding by approximately 50 percent of respondents. Bicycle boulevards were mentioned by about 43 percent of the respondent as being very likely to increase riding. Response frequencies do not sum to 100 percent because survey respondents were allowed to select multiple responses.

Mr. Kluth stated that one of the big challenges in refining the regional network, for a region the size of San Diego, is determining how to address the vast diversity in the area – including topographical challenges, right-of-way constraints, and the many different types of riders and rider preferences. The solution will be found with a comprehensive approach that uses a variety of strategies and facility types depending on the context of the situation. In an effort to address this diversity, an intercommunity bikeway network is under development that will combine standard facility types as identified by the California Highway Design Manual as well as consideration of two emerging facility types that may be used in corridors where a standard facility will not meet the needs of a wide variety of cyclists. Additional information about the use and implementation of two such facilities, cycle tracks and bicycle boulevards, is contained in Attachment 3 of the report. The application of a corridor classification system upon the Regional Network using these five classification types will take place in the Phase Four of the Plan. It also is important to recognize that all roadways are open to bicycle travel unless it is specifically prohibited and should be considered as part of the greater regional and local bicycle network that serves to supplement streets and roadways that include Class I, II, and III facilities.

Mr. Kluth stated that proposed changes to the existing Regional Bikeway Corridors consist of five new corridors and the realignment of four corridors that are proposed to serve

higher density areas. In addition, given previous direction from the Transportation Committee and the nature of the citizen input generated from the public outreach efforts, Mr. Kluth stated that a sub-network showing a "spine" of potential Class I facility locations also was determined.

Mr. Kluth stated that in December the Transportation Committee will be asked to select a preferred network and facility types, as well as provide input on a preferred funding strategy. The Transportation Committee also will be asked to provide input on the recommended goals and objectives of the Plan. A first draft of the Plan is expected to be complete in early 2009 followed by a 30-day public review period. Necessary revisions to the Plan will follow public review. The Final Report is expected in spring 2009.

Kathy Keehan, San Diego County Bicycle Coalition, expressed her support for the Regional Bike Plan and her appreciation for staff work on the project. She stated that this project confirms that people want bicycles as an option for transportation and this was an opportunity for those people to express what they need to support the use of their bikes. Ms. Keehan commented that we want to reinforce the historic opportunity at the local, state and federal levels and keep the Plan on fast track to get federal dollars to improve the pedestrian and bike environment in the County.

Councilmember Monroe commented that there is a funding strategy for the bike plan to go after those federal dollars but it is not sponsored by SANDAG. He commented that there is a group of interested parties who want to get into SAFETEA-LU and get funds authorized for projects in the County. He stated that the aim of the current federal strategy is to get projects funded around the country to see if they can be effective to get people out of their cars and onto their bikes. This issue is very active and we need to make sure we have this added into the legislative guidelines so staff can actively pursue federal funding for this project. Councilmember Monroe stated that SANDAG should authorize the pursuit of federal funding for the Regional Bike Plan in its FY 2009 Legislative Program.

Mr. Gallegos stated that staff would be presenting the FY 2009 Legislative Program to the Board of Directors at its next policy meeting for discussion on what the Board wants to advocate for during that fiscal year. The Regional Bike Plan would fit into advocacy for transit and other alternatives for transportation in the region.

Councilmember Campbell commented that during the UCSD Lake Arrowhead Symposium one presentation stated that Denmark has highest use of bicycles than any other country and perhaps the reason was because they also had a 160 percent sales tax on vehicles.

Councilmember Monroe commented that at the recent groundbreaking in Imperial Beach for the newest portion of the regional bike path, Congressman Filner expressed his support for the Regional Bike Plan and we need to lobby him for his continued support.

Deputy Mayor Rindone stated that the Regional Bike Plan and the bike path are the types of actions and projects that take the region in the right direction to reduce greenhouse gases.

Action: This item was presented for discussion only.

14. SPRINTER PROJECT STATUS REPORT AND SANDAG INDEPENDENT ASSESSMENT (INFORMATION)

Jim Linthicum, Division Director presented the item and stated that only punch list work remains for the Mainline contractor. All work could be completed within one month if the contractor devoted the resources to do so. Concurrently, other contractors are working on maintaining the landscaping and providing additional stormwater protection measures.

The Inland Rail Trail is complete except for punch list work. Operations and maintenance agreements are being negotiated with the Cities of Escondido and San Marcos with a goal of turning over the facility to each city next month.

Mr. Linthicum stated that although daily ridership decreased slightly from 8,658 in early September to 8,308 in mid October, it continues to trend upwards. A survey of the station parking lots in September showed an average occupancy of 36 percent with the Rancho del Oro and Escondido Transit Center parking lots over 50 percent full.

Mr. Linthicum stated that no formal claims have been filed on the Mainline contract; however, there are outstanding disputes concerning the signal and communication work and the connections of the rail to the bridges. The contractor also believes it was delayed by changes to the work since the settlement agreement was signed in spring 2007. The contractor has not yet validated the delay via the required "time impact analyses" and, therefore, is subject to potential liquidated damages that now total \$4.6 million.

NCTD has a tentative agreement with the contractor to close out the San Marcos Loop contract. The Vehicle Maintenance facility contract was completed with no claims. The DMU vehicle contract is still open for retention purposes but there are no outstanding disputes.

Mr. Linthicum stated that the October estimate at completion (EAC) is \$479.3 million. It includes a \$6.5 million contingency and assumes NCTD will pay the maximum potential value of the settlement agreement with the Mainline contractor. It also includes a forecasted cost for all outstanding invoices and change orders yet to be negotiated. The project budget set by the NCTD Board and included in the Amended Recovery Plan for the FTA is \$484.1 million, giving NCTD an additional \$4.8 million of capacity between budget and EAC.

Mr. Linthicum stated that risks to budget lie only with the Mainline contract. Final cost is now dependent on how the issues described above are resolved and whether new claims are submitted later this year. In addition to the claims, the cost to analyze, negotiate, and defend any claim also must be considered as a risk to budget.

Action: This item was presented for information only.

15. UPCOMING MEETINGS

Chair Madaffer announced that there will be a joint meeting of the Board of Directors, Regional Planning Committee, and Transportation Committee on Friday, December 5, 2008, at 10:00 a.m. at Caltrans offices on Taylor Street. Chair Madaffer encouraged all member jurisdictions to bring their City/County Planners and City Managers to the joint meeting to discuss regional planning.

The next meeting of the Transportation Committee is scheduled for December 12, 2008, at 9 a.m. **Please note that the December meeting will be held on the second Friday of the month and will meet once due to the Christmas holiday schedule.**

16. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Madaffer adjourned the meeting at 11:28 a.m.

Attachment: Attendance Sheet

**CONFIRMED ATTENDANCE
SANDAG TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE MEETING
NOVEMBER 7, 2008**

GEOGRAPHICAL AREA/ ORGANIZATION	JURISDICTION	NAME	MEMBER/ ALTERNATE	ATTENDING	COMMENTS
North County Coastal	City of Carlsbad	Matt Hall	Member	Yes	
	City of Del Mar	Dave Druker	Alternate	Yes	
North County Inland	City of Escondido	Lori Holt Pfeiler	Member	Yes	
	City of Vista	Bob Campbell	Alternate	Yes	
East County	City of Santee	Jack Dale (Vice Chair)	Member	Yes	
	City of La Mesa	Art Madrid	Alternate	No	
South County	City of Coronado	Phil Monroe	Member	Yes	
	City of Chula Vista	Jerry Rindone	Alternate	Yes	
City of San Diego	----	Jim Madaffer (Chair)	Member	Yes	
	----	Toni Atkins	Alternate	Yes	
	----	Ben Hueso	Alternate	No	
County of San Diego	----	Ron Roberts	Member	Yes	
	----	Greg Cox	Alternate	No	
	----	Bill Horn	Alternate	No	
Metropolitan Transit System	City of Poway	Bob Emery	Member	Yes	
	MTS	Harry Mathis	Alternate	Yes	
North County Transit District		Ed Gallo	Member	Yes	
		Jerome Stocks	Alternate	No	As ex-officio 2 nd Chair
		Chris Orlando	Alternate	No	
San Diego County Regional Airport Authority		Charlene Zettel	Member	Yes	
		Jim Desmond	Alternate	Yes	
		Ramona Finnilla	Alternate	No	
ADVISORY/LIAISON Caltrans	----	Pedro Orso-Delgado	Member	Yes	
	---	Bill Figge	Alternate	Yes	
SCTCA	---	Albert Phoenix	Member	Yes	
		Shane Chapparosa	Alternate	No	