



401 B Street, Suite 800
San Diego, CA 92101-4231
(619) 699-1900
Fax (619) 699-1905
www.sandag.org

March 28, 2013

File Number 3100600

MEMBER AGENCIES

- Cities of
- Carlsbad
- Chula Vista
- Coronado
- Del Mar
- El Cajon
- Encinitas
- Escondido
- Imperial Beach
- La Mesa
- Lemon Grove
- National City
- Oceanside
- Poway
- San Diego
- San Marcos
- Santee
- Solana Beach
- Vista
- and
- County of San Diego

ADVISORY MEMBERS

- Imperial County
- California Department of Transportation
- Metropolitan Transit System
- North County Transit District
- United States Department of Defense
- San Diego Unified Port District
- San Diego County Water Authority
- Southern California Tribal Chairmen's Association
- Mexico

TO: San Diego Region Conformity Working Group

FROM: Rachel Kennedy, Senior Regional Planner

SUBJECT: Cancellation of April 3, 2013, San Diego Region Conformity Working Group meeting

The San Diego Region Conformity Working Group (CWG) meeting scheduled for Wednesday, April 3, 2013, has been cancelled. The next meeting of the CWG is scheduled for Wednesday, May 1, 2013, from 10:30 a.m. – 12 noon.

Please find the summary of the last meeting on March 6, 2013, enclosed for your information.

If you have questions or a specific issue or topic that you would like to discuss at a future meeting, don't hesitate to contact me at (619) 699-1929 or by e-mail at Rachel.Kennedy@sandag.org. Thank you.

RKE/AHOF/hob

Enclosure: 1. Summary of the March 6, 2013, Meeting

San Diego Association of Governments
SAN DIEGO REGION CONFORMITY WORKING GROUP

SUMMARY OF THE MARCH 6, 2013, MEETING

File Number 3100600

Item #1: INTRODUCTIONS

Self-introductions were made. See attached attendance list.

Item #2: SUMMARY OF February 6, 2012, MEETING

Rachel Kennedy, SANDAG, asked the Conformity Working Group (CWG) to review the meeting summary. No comments were made.

Item #3: PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS/MEMBER COMMENTS

No public comments were made.

Item #4: DRAFT AIR QUALITY CONFORMITY ANALYSIS FOR THE 2012 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM AMENDMENT NO. 2 AND 2050 REGIONAL TRANSPORTATION PLAN CONFORMITY REDETERMINATION

Ms. Kennedy provided a summary of the Draft Air Quality Conformity Analysis For the 2012 Regional Transportation Improvement Program Amendment No. 2 and 2050 Regional Transportation Plan Conformity Redetermination document.

The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) designated the San Diego region as a marginal nonattainment area for the 2008 ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standard, effective July 20, 2012. The San Diego region is required to demonstrate transportation conformity to the new standard by July 20, 2013. The CWG will discuss the draft air quality conformity document to re-determine conformity of the 2050 San Diego Regional Transportation Plan: Our Region, Our Future (2050 RTP) and determine conformity of the 2012 Regional Transportation Improvement Program (RTIP) Amendment No. 2.

On October 28, 2011, the SANDAG Board made a finding of conformity of the 2050 RTP and the 2010 RTIP Amendment No. 13 and adopted the plan. The U.S. Department of Transportation (DOT), in consultation with U.S. EPA, made its conformity determination on December 2, 2011.

On September 28, 2012, the SANDAG Board of Directors adopted the final 2012 RTIP and its conformity determination and re-determination of conformity for the 2050 RTP. The U.S. DOT, in consultation with U.S. EPA, made its conformity determination on December 14, 2012.

The San Diego region attained the federal One-Hour Ozone Standard in 2001. The U.S. EPA re-designated the San Diego air basin as attainment/maintenance and approved the One-Hour Ozone Maintenance Plan as a State Implementation Plan (SIP) revision, effective on July 28, 2003. On June 15, 2005, the U.S. EPA revoked the federal One-Hour Ozone Standard after the 1997 Eight-Hour Ozone Standard became applicable for conformity.

On April 15, 2004, the EPA designated the San Diego air basin as non-attainment for the 1997 Eight-Hour Ozone Standard. This designation took effect on June 15, 2004. However, several areas that are tribal lands in eastern San Diego County were excluded from the non-attainment designation. As shown in Figure B.1, La Posta Areas #1 and #2, Cuyapaipe, Manzanita, and Campo Areas #1 and #2 are attainment areas for the 1997 Eight-Hour Ozone National Ambient Air Quality Standards.

The air basin initially was classified as a basic non-attainment area under Subpart 1 of the Clean Air Act and the attainment date for the 1997 Eight-Hour Ozone Standard was set as June 15, 2009. In cooperation SANDAG, the San Diego Air Pollution Control District (APCD) developed an Eight-Hour Ozone Attainment Plan for the 1997 standard, which was submitted to the U.S. EPA on June 15, 2007.

The budgets in the Eight-Hour Ozone Attainment Plan for San Diego County were found adequate for transportation conformity purposes by the U.S. EPA, effective June 9, 2008.

Ms. Kennedy stated that the CWG comment period ends on March 27, 2013. She provided a summary the sections of the document related to transportation modeling procedures. Every three to five years, SANDAG produces a long-range forecast of population, housing, and employment growth for the San Diego region. The most recent is the 2050 Regional Growth Forecast, which was adopted by the SANDAG Board on October 28, 2011, and was utilized in the development of the 2050 RTP and the 2012 RTIP, as amended. It was also noted that SANDAG follows a widely used, four-step transportation modeling process of trip generation, trip distribution, mode choice, and assignment to forecast travel activity in the San Diego region. The estimates of regional transportation-related emissions analysis meet the requirements established in the Transportation Conformity Rule, Sections 93.122(b) and 93.122(c). These requirements relate to the procedures to determine regional transportation-related emissions, including the use of network-based travel models, methods to estimate traffic speeds and delays, and the estimation of vehicle miles of travel.

Ms. Kennedy then referenced page 22 of the agenda package which details EMFAC2007 and EMFAC2011, which were used for the regional emissions analysis.

In November 2006, California Air Resource Board (CARB) released EMFAC2007, an emissions inventory model that calculates emissions for motor vehicles operating in California. It is an integrated model that combines emission rate data with vehicle activity to calculate regional emissions. The U.S. EPA approved EMFAC2007 for use in conformity determinations on January 18, 2008.

In September 2011, CARB released an updated version of the emission inventory model, EMFAC2011. CARB has submitted EMFAC2011 to U.S. EPA for approval for use in conformity determinations. EMFAC2011 is an integrated model that combines emission rate data with vehicle activity to calculate regional emissions. EMFAC2011 reflects recent CARB rulemakings for on road diesel fleet rules, Pavely Clean Car Standards, and the Low Carbon Fuel Standard (LCFS). EMFAC2011 is made up of three modules: EMFAC2011-SG (scenario air quality assessment); EMFAC2011-LDV (passenger vehicle emissions); and EMFAC2011-HD (diesel trucks and buses). As noted in CARB's EMFAC2011 Technical Documentation EMFAC2011-SG takes the output from EMFAC2011-LDV and EMFAC2011-HD and applies scaling factors to estimate emissions consistent with regional vehicle miles of travel (VMT) and speeds. Scaling factors are based on changes in total VMT. VMT distribution by vehicle class, and speed distribution. The SG module reports total emissions as tons

per average weekday for each pollutant by vehicle class, and the total vehicle fleet for years between 1990 and 2035.

As U.S. EPA has yet to approve EMFAC2011 for use in conformity determinations, SANDAG staff has conducted the regional emission analysis with both versions of the software and included both analyses in the draft document.

Ms. Kennedy stated that effective June 9, 2008, the U.S. EPA found the Eight-Hour Ozone budgets included in the Eight-Hour Ozone Attainment Plan for San Diego County adequate for transportation conformity purposes. Beginning in February 2013, SANDAG prepared countywide forecasts of average weekday Reactive Organic Gasses (ROG) and Nitrogen Oxides (NOx) emissions for 2015, 2020, 2025, 2035, 2040, and 2050 (for informational purposes), using the EMFAC2007 and EMFAC2011 models. ROG and NOx emissions are based upon the summer season

Regional transportation forecasts were initiated in February 7, 2013. Output from the TransCAD model was then reformatted and adjusted to be useful for emissions modeling. The analysis years were selected to comply with Title 40, Code of Federal Regulations (40 CFR) Sections 93.106(a)(1) and 93.118(a) of the Transportation Conformity Rule and the approved methodology for conducting the air quality conformity analyses for the 2012 RTIP, as amended, and 2050 RTP, which shortened the conformity horizon to 2040 and requires an informational analysis of the plan horizon year (2050). According to these sections of the Conformity Rule, the first horizon year (2015) must be within ten years from the base year used to validate the regional transportation model (2008), the last horizon year must be the last year of the transportation plan's forecast period, or in the case of the 2012 RTIP, as amended, and 2050 RTP, the last year of the conformity determination (2040), and the horizon years may be no more than ten years apart (2025 and 2035). If the budgets from the Re-designation Request and Maintenance Plan for the 1997 National Ozone Standard for San Diego County are deemed adequate for use in conformity determinations prior to the approval of this document, an analysis year of 2020 also will be included to demonstrate conformity to the budget included in the Maintenance Plan.

Carbon Monoxide (CO) regional emissions were projected for 2015, 2018 (interpolated), 2020, 2025, 2035, 2040, and 2050 (for informational purposes) for the conformity determination of the 2012 RTIP, as amended, and 2050 RTP conformity redetermination. CO emissions are based upon the winter season.

Ms. Kennedy highlighted Table B.8 which illustrated the projects which are considered exempt from conformity. This table shows short-term exempt projects and it was noted that additional unidentified projects could be funded with revenues expected to be available from the continuation of existing state and federal programs.

It was also noted that there are four federally-approved Transportation Control Measures (TCMs) that must be implemented in San Diego, which the SIP refers to as transportation tactics. They include ridesharing, transit improvements, traffic flow improvements, and bicycle facilities and programs. These TCMs were established in the 1982 SIP, which identified general objectives and implementing actions for each tactic. The TCMs have been fully implemented. Ridesharing, transit, bicycling, and traffic flow improvements continue to be funded, although the level of implementation established in the SIP has been surpassed.

Ms. Kennedy noted that the consultation process followed to prepare the air quality conformity analysis for the 2012 RTIP, as amended, and 2050 RTP complies with the San Diego Transportation Conformity Procedures adopted in July 1998. In turn, these procedures comply with federal requirements under 40 CFR Section 93. Interagency consultation involves SANDAG (as the Metropolitan Planning Organization for San Diego County), the APCD, the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans), CARB, U.S. DOT, and U.S. EPA. Consultation is a three-tier process that:

1. Formulates and reviews drafts through a conformity working group
2. Provides local agencies and the public with opportunities for input through existing regional advisory committees and workshops
3. Seeks comments from affected federal and state agencies through participation in the development of draft documents and circulation of supporting materials prior to formal adoption

SANDAG consulted on the development of the Air Quality Conformity Analysis of the 2012 RTIP and 2050 RTP at meetings of the CWG, as follows:

- On December 5, 2012, SANDAG staff presented the schedule for the preparation of the 2012 RTIP Amendment No. 2 and its air quality conformity analysis. The CWG also discussed the conformity analysis budgets, timeframe, and boundary. Staff confirmed that a redetermination of conformity would be done for the 2050 RTP, in conjunction with the 2012 RTIP, as amended, for consistency purposes.
- On February 6, 2013, SANDAG staff presented information about the criteria and procedures to be followed for its conformity analysis. Staff presented information on the 2050 Regional Growth Forecast, Travel Demand Model, Transportation Control Measures, the Revenue Constrained financial assumptions, latest emissions model and emissions budgets, and public involvement and outreach. Staff also confirmed that the conformity timeline would be shortened to the year 2040, and an informational analysis will be conducted for projects in the 2041-2050 timeframe.
- On February 6, 2013, SANDAG staff distributed the draft list of capacity increasing and non-capacity increasing projects to be included in the 2012 RTIP amendment for interagency consultation. The project lists were discussed at the February 6, 2013, CWG meeting.
- On February 26, 2013, SANDAG released the draft air quality conformity analysis of the 2012 RTIP, as amended, and 2050 RTP to the CWG for a 30-day review-and-comment period. The draft air quality analysis was discussed at the March 6, 2013, meeting of the CWG. The draft 2012 RTIP, as amended, will be presented to the *TransNet* Independent Taxpayer Oversight Committee (ITOC) on April 10, 2013, for input.

- On April 5, 2013, the SANDAG Transportation Committee will be asked to release the draft 2012 RTIP, as amended, and its conformity determination and the 2050 RTP conformity redetermination for a 30-day public review period.
- On May 24, 2013, the SANDAG Board will be asked to adopt the Final 2012 RTIP, as amended, and its conformity determination and the 2050 RTP conformity redetermination. Members of the public are welcomed to provide comments at meetings of the CWG, ITOC, the Transportation Committee, and the SANDAG Board of Directors.

Ms. Kennedy asked if the CWG had any questions or comments. Mr. Carl Selnick from San Diego APCD noted that as an interpolation was done for the year 2018 to show consistency with the carbon monoxide budgets, the projects for 2018 should be shown in the project tables. Mike Brady from Caltrans concurred with this statement.

Ms. Kennedy and Elisa Arias, SANDAG, stated that SANDAG staff would review the project tables and make appropriate edits. No other comments or questions were made at this time.

Item #5: REDESIGNATION REQUEST AND MAINTENANCE PLAN FOR THE 1997 NATIONAL OZONE STANDARD FOR SAN DIEGO COUNTY UPDATE

John Kelly, U.S. EPA, provided an overview of the item and stated that the staff contact for this project is John Ungvarsky. Mr. Ungvarsky is in the process of getting the proposal document signed and approved within the next few weeks. The budget letters that will be sent to the state need to be deemed adequate and signed as well.

Ms. Kennedy asked if SANDAG would need to wait to use the budgets until after the adequacy process and public comment period, or if it is possible to use the budgets once the letter had been received. Mr. Kelly stated that he is unsure of the answer to that question, but he thinks that publication in the Federal Register notice may need to occur first and that the budgets are affective fifteen days after publication. Mr. Brady stated that once you receive the letter you can use the budgets.

To clarify the conversation Ms. Arias stated that the goal is to have the budgets approved prior to May 24, 2013, when the SANDAG Board will meet and be asked to approve the 2012 RTIP Amendment No. 2 and its conformity document. Mr. Brady and Mr. Kelly stated that there should not be any type of timing problem because usually the letter is signed at the same time the Federal Register notice is signed and published, which is followed by a fifteen day public comment period, so in total the process should take less than a month.

Item #6: EMFAC2011 AND DEVELOPMENT OF NEXT VERSION OF EMFAC

Ms. Kennedy stated that approval of EMFAC2011 for use in conformity determinations was published in the Federal Register. Jason Crow, CARB, provided an update on the EMFAC2013 development process. He stated that the 2013 update is going to complete the modernization of the EMFAC model that was started with EMFAC 2011. The update will bring the model into a database structure, update all the emissions factors, include a new focus on greenhouse gases, and enhance the scenario based planning potential. There will be a workshop on EMFAC2013 in April to

get input from users. Ms. Kennedy requested that Mr. Crow send the workshop information to the group once the date is established.

Item #7: OTHER BUSINESS

Mike Brady informed the CWG that the Statewide Conformity Working Group meeting is scheduled for Wednesday, March 13, 2013, from 10 a.m. to 1 p.m.

Item #8: ADJOURNMENT AND NEXT MEETING

Ms. Kennedy stated that the next meeting is for scheduled meeting on Wednesday, April 3, 2013, from 10:30 a.m. to 12 noon at SANDAG. The agenda package will be sent out prior to the meeting.

San Diego Region Conformity Working Group

Meeting Attendance

March 6, 2013

Name	Agency
Jason Crow (phone)	CARB
Mike Brady (phone)	Caltrans
John Kelly (phone)	EPA
Elisa Arias	SANDAG
Andrea Hoff	SANDAG
Rachel Kennedy	SANDAG
Michelle Merino	SANDAG
Evan Wasserman	SANDAG
Carl Selnick (phone)	SDAPCD
Domingo Vigil (phone)	SDAPCD
Carla Walecka (phone)	TCA