



401 B Street, Suite 800
 San Diego, CA 92101-4231
 (619) 699-1900
 Fax (619) 699-1905
 sandag.org

Shoreline Preservation Working Group

Thursday, March 4, 2021
 11:30 a.m.

****Teleconference Meeting****

Agenda Highlights

- **Application Process to Select Newly Created Non-Voting Working Group Member Seats**
- **City of Oceanside Beach Sand Replenishment and Retention Device Feasibility Study**

MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT AMIDST COVID-19 PANDEMIC:

The SANDAG Shoreline Preservation Working Group (Working Group) meeting scheduled for Thursday, March 4, 2021, will be conducted virtually in accordance with Governor Newsom’s State of Emergency declaration regarding the COVID-19 outbreak, Executive Order N-29-20, and the Guidance for Gatherings issued by the California Department of Public Health. Working Group members will primarily participate in the meeting virtually, while practicing social distancing, from individual remote locations. There are a few options for public participation:

- At the time of the meeting, listen to the audio stream through sandag.org
- Observe the meeting via Zoom
- Submit comments via email to clerk@sandag.org
- To participate via Zoom webinar, click the link to join the meeting: zoom.us/j/98547439809
- To participate via Telephone, dial a number based on your current location
 US: +1 669 900 6833 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 346 248 7799 or
 +1 312 626 6799 or +1 929 205 6099 or +1 301 715 8592
- The Webinar ID is: 985 4743 9809
- International numbers available: zoom.us/u/acV0sp77x

SANDAG is relying on commercial technology to broadcast the meeting via Zoom. With the recent increase of virtual meetings, platforms such as Microsoft Teams, WebEx, GoToMeeting, and Zoom are working to scale their systems to meet the new demand. If we experience technical difficulty or you are unexpectedly disconnected from the broadcast, please close and re-open your browser and click the link to re-join the meeting. SANDAG staff will take all possible measures to ensure a publicly accessible experience. Please note that the meeting will continue to be broadcast audio-only via the “Listen to the meeting” link on sandag.org.

Public Comments: Persons who wish to address the Working Group on an item to be considered at this meeting, or on non-agendized issues, may email comments to the Working Group at clerk@sandag.org (please reference: “March 4 Shoreline Preservation Working Group Meeting” in your subject line and identify the item number(s) to which your comments pertain). Comments received by 4 p.m. on Wednesday, March 3 will be provided to Working Group members prior to the meeting. Comments received during the meeting will be read into the record at the appropriate time for public comments. All comments received prior to the close of the meeting will be made part of the meeting record.

MEMBER AGENCIES

Cities of
 Carlsbad
 Chula Vista
 Coronado
 Del Mar
 El Cajon
 Encinitas
 Escondido
 Imperial Beach
 La Mesa
 Lemon Grove
 National City
 Oceanside
 Poway
 San Diego
 San Marcos
 Santee
 Solana Beach
 Vista
 and
 County of San Diego

ADVISORY MEMBERS

Imperial County
 San Diego County
 Regional Airport Authority
 California Department
 of Transportation
 Metropolitan
 Transit System
 North County
 Transit District
 United States
 Department of Defense
 Port of San Diego
 San Diego County
 Water Authority
 Southern California
 Tribal Chairmen’s Association
 Mexico



Welcome to SANDAG. Members of the public may speak to the Working Group on any item at the time the Working Group is considering the item. Public speakers are limited to three minutes or less per person. The Working Group may only take action on any item appearing on the agenda.

In order to keep the public informed in an efficient manner and facilitate public participation, SANDAG also provides access to all agenda and meeting materials online at sandag.org/meetings. Additionally, interested persons can sign up for email notifications at sandag.org/subscribe.

SANDAG operates its programs without regard to race, color, and national origin in compliance with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act. SANDAG has developed procedures for investigating and tracking Title VI complaints, and the procedures for filing a complaint are available to the public upon request. Questions concerning SANDAG nondiscrimination obligations or complaint procedures should be directed to the SANDAG General Counsel, John Kirk, at (619) 699-1997 or john.kirk@sandag.org. Any person who believes himself or herself or any specific class of persons to be subjected to discrimination prohibited by Title VI also may file a written complaint with the Federal Transit Administration.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), SANDAG will accommodate persons who require assistance in order to participate in SANDAG meetings. If such assistance is required, please contact the SANDAG ADA Coordinator, the Director of Diversity and Equity, at (619) 699-1900, at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting. To request this document or related reports in an alternative format, please call (619) 699-1900 or (619) 699-1904 (TTY), or fax (619) 699-1905.

SANDAG agenda materials can be made available in alternative languages. To make a request, call (619) 699-1900 at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting.

Los materiales de la agenda de SANDAG están disponibles en otros idiomas. Para hacer una solicitud, llame al (619) 699-1900 al menos 72 horas antes de la reunión.

如有需要, 我们可以把SANDAG议程材料翻译成其他語言.

请在会议前至少 72 小时打电话 (619) 699-1900 提出请求.

Mission Statement

The 18 cities and county government are SANDAG serving as the forum for regional decision-making. SANDAG builds consensus; makes strategic plans; obtains and allocates resources; plans, engineers, and builds public transit; and provides information on a broad range of topics pertinent to the region's quality of life.

San Diego Association of Governments · 401 B Street, Suite 800, San Diego, CA 92101-4231
(619) 699-1900 · Fax (619) 699-1905 · sandag.org

Shoreline Preservation Working Group

Thursday, March 4, 2021

Item No.		Action
1.	Welcome and Introductions	
+2.	Approval of Meeting Minutes The Shoreline Preservation Working Group (Working Group) is asked to review and approve the minutes from its December 3, 2020, meeting.	Approve
3.	Public Comments/Communications/Member Comments Public comments under this agenda item will be limited to five public speakers. Members of the public shall have the opportunity to address the Working Group on any issue within the jurisdiction of the committee that is not on this agenda. Other public comments will be heard during the items under the heading "Reports."	
Reports		
+4.	Application Process to Select Newly Created Non-Voting Working Group Member Seats <i>Sarah Pierce, SANDAG</i> Staff is seeking input from the Working Group on the application process to fill two newly created seats representing the environmental justice/climate equity and crossborder communities.	Discussion
5.	City of Oceanside Beach Sand Replenishment and Retention Device Feasibility Study <i>Kiel Koger, City of Oceanside</i> <i>Brian Leslie, GHD</i> The City of Oceanside Public Works Department has initiated a feasibility study that seeks to develop a strategy to protect city beaches from the impacts of long-term shoreline erosion. The goal of the study is to identify a beach-replenishment/retention strategy that is environmentally sensitive, financially feasible, and has a reasonable chance of being approved through the regulatory permitting process. Additional information can be found on the City of Oceanside's website .	Information
6.	Continued Public Comments If the five-speaker limit for public comments was exceeded at the beginning of this agenda, other public comments will be taken at this time. Subjects of previous agenda items may not again be addressed under public comment.	
7.	Upcoming Meetings The next Working Group meeting is scheduled for Thursday, June 3, 2021, at 11:30 a.m.	Information

8. Adjournment

+ next to an item indicates an attachment

March 4, 2021

Action: **Approve**

December 3, 2020, Meeting Minutes

A video recording of this meeting is available to view on the SANDAG YouTube channel at youtube.com/watch?v=PXXr8ogc2iM.

1. Welcome and Introductions

Chair Serge Dedina (City of Imperial Beach) called the meeting of the Shoreline Preservation Working Group to order at 11:35 a.m. and welcomed Kanani Leslie as the new representative of the California Coastal Commission.

2. Approval of Meeting Minutes (Approve)

Action: Upon a motion by Vice Chair Dwight Worden (City of Del Mar) and a second by Councilmember Kellie Hinze (City of Encinitas), the Shoreline Preservation Working Group approved the minutes from its June 4, 2020, meeting.

Yes: Chair Dedina, Vice Chair Worden, Councilmember Priya Bhat-Patel (City of Carlsbad), Councilmember Bill Sandke (City of Coronado), Deputy Mayor Hinze, Councilmember Ryan Keim (City of Oceanside), Councilmember Jennifer Campbell (City of San Diego), Deputy Mayor Judy Hegenauer (City of Solana Beach), and Walter Wilson (U.S. Navy).

No: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: City of Chula Vista, City of National City, County of San Diego, and Port of San Diego.

3. Public Comments/Communications/Member Comments

Members of the public and members of the public had the opportunity to address the Working Group on issues not on this agenda.

Reports

4. Shoreline Preservation Working Group Charter Update and Consideration of Non-Voting Membership Expansion (Recommend)

Action: Upon a motion by Vice Chair Worden and a second by Councilmember Sandke, the Shoreline Preservation Working Group recommended that the Regional Planning Committee approve the revised charter with the addition of representatives from Caltrans, the environmental justice/climate equity community, and the crossborder community.

The motion passed.

Yes: Chair Dedina, Vice Chair Worden, Councilmember Bhat-Patel, Councilmember Sandke, Deputy Mayor Hinze, Councilmember Keim, Deputy Mayor Hegenauer, and Walter Wilson.

No: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: City of Chula Vista, City of National City, City of San Diego, County of San Diego, and Port of San Diego.

5. Regional Plan Vision Presentation (Discussion)

Working Group members provided feedback on the major components of the Vision and shared how the Vision affects their areas of interest.

6. Upcoming Meetings (Information)

The next Shoreline Preservation Working Group meeting is scheduled for Thursday, March 4, 2021, at 11:30 a.m.

7. Adjournment

Chair Dedina (Imperial Beach) adjourned the meeting at 12:54 p.m.

Confirmed Attendance at SANDAG Shoreline Preservation Working Group Meeting

December 3, 2020

Jurisdiction	Name	Attended	Comments
City of Imperial Beach	Mayor Serge Dedina, Chair (Primary)	Yes	
	Councilmember Paloma Aguirre (Alternate)	No	
City of San Diego	Councilmember Jennifer Campbell (Primary)	Yes	Not present for Item 4
	Councilmember Barbara Bry (Alternate)	No	
County of San Diego	Supervisor Kristin Gaspar	No	
City of Carlsbad	Councilmember Priya Bhat-Patel (Primary)	Yes	
	Councilmember Keith Blackburn (Alternate)	No	
City of Coronado	Councilmember Bill Sandke (Primary)	Yes	
	Councilmember Mike Donovan (Alternate)	Yes	
City of Del Mar	Councilmember Dwight Worden, Vice Chair (Primary)	Yes	
	Councilmember Terry Gaasterland (Alternate)	Yes	
City of Encinitas	Deputy Mayor. Councilmember Kellie Hinze (Primary)	Yes	
	Councilmember Jody Hubbard (Alternate)	No	
City of Oceanside	Councilmember Ryan Keim (Primary)	Yes	
	Councilmember Esther Sanchez (Alternate)	Yes	
City of Solana Beach	Councilmember Judy Hegenauer (Primary)	Yes	
	Councilmember David Zito (Alternate)	No	
City of National City	Councilmember Ron Morrison (Primary)	No	
	Councilmember Gonzalo Quintero (Alternate)	No	
San Diego Unified Port District	Dan Malcolm (Primary)	No	
	Garry Bonelli (Alternate)	No	
United States Navy	Walter Wilson (Primary)	Yes	
	Deborah McKay (Alternate)	No	
Advisory Members			
California Coastal Commission	Kanani Leslie	Yes	
National Marine Fisheries Service	Bryant Chesney	No	
State Division of Boating and Waterways	Reinhard Flick	No	
State Department of Fish and Wildlife	Loni Adams	No	
State Department of Parks and Recreation	Darren Smith	No	
State Lands Commission	Kenneth Foster	No	

U.S. Army Corps of Engineers	Heather Schlosser	No
California Coastal Coalition	Steve Aceti	No
Coastal Environmental Rights Foundation	Marco Gonzalez	No
California Lobster and Trap Fisherman's Association	August Felando	No
Scripps Institution of Oceanography	Bonnie Ludka	No
Southern California Tribal Chairman's Association	Michael Connolly	No
Surfrider Foundation	Laura Walsh	Yes

Other Attendees

- Amy Williams
- Anne Usher
- Brian Zitt
- Eileen Maher
- Ian Clampett
- Jane Thornton
- Julia Chunn-Heer
- Kathryn Cartaino
- Kiel Koger
- Meagan Openshaw
- Megan Medina
- Michael Tully
- Michelle Blake
- Mitchell McKay
- R. Abrego
- Steve Maschue
- Susie Ming

SANDAG Staff

- Allison Wood
- Anna Lowe
- Katie Hentrich
- Sarah Pierce
- Tuere Fa'aola

March 4, 2021

Action: **Discussion**

Application Process to Select Newly Created Non-Voting Working Group Member Seats

Introduction

The Shoreline Preservation Working Group (Working Group) was formed as a committee in the 1980s and currently advises the Regional Planning Committee (RPC) on issues related to the implementation of the Shoreline Preservation Strategy adopted in 1993, the Coastal Regional Sediment Management Plan adopted in 2009, and San Diego Forward: The Regional Plan. Voting members of the Working Group and their alternates are selected by the bodies they represent. Non-voting members of the Working Group are also selected by the bodies they represent and are categorized as either Technical or Community Advisors and provide added knowledge and input to the Working Group.

At the recommendation of the Working Group, the RPC approved an update to the [Working Group's Charter](#) at their February 5, 2021, meeting. The Charter update was approved to reflect the number and type of advisory members currently serving on the Working Group and authorized staff to facilitate an application process to select two new non-voting advisors to the Working Group.

Discussion

Non-Voting Membership

Based on the Working Group's discussions on December 3, 2020, and following RPC approval on February 5, 2021, three new non-voting members will be added to the Working Group representing Caltrans, the environmental justice/climate equity community, and the crossborder community. SANDAG staff will coordinate with staff from Caltrans District 11 to select a representative to fill the newly created Caltrans seat. Staff recommends the following process to fill the environmental justice/climate equity and crossborder seats.

1. The Working Group staff liaison will work with the Working Group Chair and Vice Chair to finalize a membership application based on input received during the March 4, 2021, meeting.
2. SANDAG staff will post the membership application to the SANDAG website and send a notification to the Working Group's interested parties email list and the Social Equity Working Group's email list. Interested applicants will have 30 days to apply for these newly created positions.
3. The Working Group staff liaison will work with the Working Group Chair and Vice Chair to review the applications and will return to the Working Group with a recommendation for members' consideration and ultimate recommendation to the RPC.
4. The Working Group staff liaison will present the Working Group's recommendation to the RPC for final approval.

Membership Application Content

Staff is seeking input from the Working Group on the content of the membership application. The application will request non-voting membership information, including but not limited to the following topics:

- Basic organization information such as name, primary point of contact, and contact information.

- The organization's background and qualifications for serving on the Working Group, including information on the services the organization provides, the organization's membership, and who the organization's stakeholders are.
- A description of how the organization's mission and work align with the purpose of the Working Group to advise the RPC on issues related to implementation of the Shoreline Preservation Strategy, the Coastal Regional Sediment Management Plan, and San Diego Forward: The Regional Plan, with a focus on future sea level rise adaptation opportunities and the shoreline monitoring program.
- How the organization is uniquely positioned to represent either the environmental justice/climate equity community or the crossborder community in relation to the Working Group's purpose.

Next Steps

SANDAG staff will finalize an application with the Chair and Vice Chair based on the Working Group's discussion at the March 4, 2021, meeting. Staff will return to the Working Group with a recommendation for two new non-voting members, consistent with the process outlined in this Staff Report. Upon approval of the Working Group, SANDAG staff will recommend the newly created non-voting membership selections to the RPC for approval in Summer 2021.

Key Staff Contact: Sarah Pierce, (619) 699-7312, sarah.pierce@sandag.org