



# ***Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities***

401 B Street, Suite 800  
San Diego, CA 92101-4231  
(619) 699-1900  
Fax (619) 699-1905  
sandag.org

**Tuesday, May 4, 2021**

**3 to 4:30 p.m.**

**\*\*Teleconference Meeting\*\***

## MEETING ANNOUNCEMENT AMIDST COVID-19 PANDEMIC:

The Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) meeting scheduled for Tuesday, May 4, 2021, will be conducted virtually in accordance with Governor Newsom's State of Emergency declaration regarding the COVID-19 outbreak, Executive Order N-29-20, and the Guidance for Gatherings issued by the California Department of Public Health. Working Group members will primarily participate in the meeting virtually, while practicing social distancing, from individual remote locations.

There are a few options for public participation:

- Participate via Zoom webinar by clicking the link to join:  
<https://zoom.us/j/94521810309>
- The Webinar ID is: 945 2181 0309
- To participate via Telephone, dial a number based on your current location:  
(US: +1 669 900 6833 or 945 2181 0309# or +1 346 248 7799 or +1 253 215 8782 or +1 301 715 8592 or +1 312 626 6799 or +1 929 205 6099).
- International numbers available: <https://zoom.us/u/acpKkB5reS>

SANDAG is relying on commercial technology to broadcast the meeting via Zoom. With the recent increase of virtual meetings, platforms such as Microsoft Teams, WebEx, GoToMeeting, and Zoom are working to scale their systems to meet the new demand. If we experience technical difficulty or you are unexpectedly disconnected from the broadcast, please close and re-open your browser and click the link to re-join the meeting. SANDAG staff will take all possible measures to ensure a publicly accessible experience.

**Public Comments:** Persons who wish to address the members on an item to be considered at this meeting, or on non-agendized issues, may email comments to the Clerk at [clerk@sandag.org](mailto:clerk@sandag.org) (please reference: "May 4 COBRO Meeting" in your subject line and identify the item number(s) to which your comments pertain). Comments received by 4 p.m. on Monday, May 3, will be provided to members prior to the meeting.

If you desire to provide a live verbal comment during the meeting, please join the Zoom meeting either by computer or phone. At the time for public comments, members of the public will be advised to "Raise Hand" if they wish to provide comments. The "Raise Hand" feature can be found on the Zoom toolbar for those who are joining via computer or by entering \*9 for those who joining via telephone only. The Chair will call on members of the public by name for those joining via a computer and by the last three digits of your telephone number for those joining via telephone. All comments received prior to the close of the meeting will be made part of the meeting record.

### MEMBER AGENCIES

*Cities of  
Carlsbad  
Chula Vista  
Coronado  
Del Mar  
El Cajon  
Encinitas  
Escondido  
Imperial Beach  
La Mesa  
Lemon Grove  
National City  
Oceanside  
Poway  
San Diego  
San Marcos  
Santee  
Solana Beach  
Vista  
and  
County of San Diego*

### ADVISORY MEMBERS

*Imperial County  
San Diego County  
Regional Airport Authority  
California Department  
of Transportation  
Metropolitan  
Transit System  
North County  
Transit District  
United States  
Department of Defense  
Port of San Diego  
San Diego County  
Water Authority  
Southern California  
Tribal Chairmen's Association  
Mexico*

# SANDAG

Welcome to SANDAG. Members of the public may speak to the COBRO on any item at the time the COBRO is considering the item. Public speakers are limited to three minutes or less per person. The COBRO may only take action on any item appearing on the agenda.

In order to keep the public informed in an efficient manner and facilitate public participation, SANDAG also provides access to all agenda and meeting materials online at [sandag.org/meetings](http://sandag.org/meetings). Additionally, interested persons can sign up for email notifications at [sandag.org/subscribe](http://sandag.org/subscribe).

SANDAG operates its programs without regard to race, color, and national origin in compliance with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act. SANDAG has developed procedures for investigating and tracking Title VI complaints, and the procedures for filing a complaint are available to the public upon request. Questions concerning SANDAG nondiscrimination obligations or complaint procedures should be directed to the SANDAG General Counsel, John Kirk, at (619) 699-1997 or [john.kirk@sandag.org](mailto:john.kirk@sandag.org). Any person who believes himself or herself or any specific class of persons to be subjected to discrimination prohibited by Title VI also may file a written complaint with the Federal Transit Administration.

In compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), SANDAG will accommodate persons who require assistance in order to participate in SANDAG meetings. If such assistance is required, please contact the Clerk of the Board at [ClerkoftheBoard@sandag.org](mailto:ClerkoftheBoard@sandag.org) or at (619) 699-1985, at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting. To request this document or related reports in an alternative format, please call (619) 699-1900 or (619) 699-1904 (TTY), or fax (619) 699-1905 at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting.

SANDAG agenda materials can be made available in alternative languages. To make a request, call (619) 699-1900 at least 72 hours in advance of the meeting.

Los materiales de la agenda de SANDAG están disponibles en otros idiomas. Para hacer una solicitud, llame al (619) 699-1900 al menos 72 horas antes de la reunión.

如有需要, 我们可以把SANDAG议程材料翻译成其他语言。

请在会议前至少 72 小时打电话 (619) 699-1900 提出请求。

## **Mission Statement**

*The 18 cities and county government are SANDAG serving as the forum for regional decision-making. SANDAG builds consensus; makes strategic plans; obtains and allocates resources; plans, engineers, and builds public transit; and provides information on a broad range of topics pertinent to the region's quality of life.*

## **Our Commitment to Equity**

*We hold ourselves accountable to the communities we serve. We acknowledge we have much to learn and much to change; and we firmly uphold equity and inclusion for every person in the San Diego region. This includes historically underserved, systemically marginalized groups impacted by actions and inactions at all levels of our government and society.*

*We have an obligation to eliminate disparities and ensure that safe, healthy, accessible, and inclusive opportunities are available to everyone. In 2021, SANDAG will develop an equity action plan that will inform how we plan, prioritize, fund, and build projects and programs; frame how we work with our communities; define how we recruit and develop our employees; guide our efforts to conduct unbiased research and interpret data; and set expectations for companies and stakeholders that work with us.*

*We are committed to creating a San Diego region where every person who visits, works, and lives can thrive.*

San Diego Association of Governments · 401 B Street, Suite 800, San Diego, CA 92101-4231  
(619) 699-1900 · Fax (619) 699-1905 · [sandag.org](http://sandag.org)

# Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities

Tuesday, May 4, 2021

Item No.		Action
1.	Welcome and Introductions	
2.	Public Comments/Communications/Member Comments Members of the public shall have the opportunity to address Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) on any issue within the jurisdiction of the Committee that is not on this agenda.	
+3.	Approval of Meeting Minutes	Approve
	+3A. October 6, 2020, COBRO Meeting Minutes	
	+3B. February 26, 2021, Borders Committee, COBRO, and the Municipalities and State Government of Baja California Joint Meeting Minutes	
	+3C. March 26, 2021, Borders Committee and COBRO Joint Meeting Minutes	
<b>Reports</b>		
4.	Tijuana River Initiative <i>Hernando Durán, Tijuana Verde</i> An overview on a citizen-driven initiative, formed by a partnership of institutions, non-profit organizations, and people that share a common desire to bring new life to the Tijuana River; to achieve a more livable, sustainable, competitive, and prosperous binational region in an environment that promotes wellbeing for communities, will be presented.	Information
+5.	2021 California-Baja California Border Master Plan Recommendations <i>Jose Marquez, Caltrans</i> <i>Cheryl Mason, SANDAG Service Bureau</i> An overview on the recommendations for the 2021 California-Baja California Border Master Plan (BMP) will be presented. The recommendations approved by its Policy Advisory Committee and Technical Working Group, were developed to promote progress made toward implementing the main objectives of the BMP as a continuous and coordinated binational planning process.	Information
6.	San Diego-Tijuana World Design Capital 2024 Submittal <i>Michele Morris, Design Forward Alliance</i> An overview on a submittal for the San Diego-Tijuana region in the 2024 World Design Capital (WDC) will be presented. The WDC is designated every two years by the World Design Organization and recognizes cities for their effective use of design to drive economic, social, cultural, and environmental development.	Information

**7. Upcoming Meetings**

**Information**

The next COBRO meeting is tentatively scheduled for Tuesday, July 6, 2021, at 3 pm.

**8. Adjournment**

+ next to an item indicates an attachment

May 4, 2021

Action: **Approve**

## **October 6, 2020, Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities Meeting Minutes**

Chair Paul Ganster (Institute for Regional Studies of the Californias – San Diego State University [SDSU]) called the meeting of the Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) to order at 3 p.m.

### **1. Welcome and Introductions**

### **2. Approval of Meeting Minutes (Approve)**

Action: Upon a motion by Chair Ganster and a second by Vice Chair Efrain Ibarra (South County EDC), the COBRO approved the minutes from its May 7, 2021, July 2, 2019, September 3, 2019, and February 4, 2020, meetings.

The motion passed.

Yes: Chair Ganster, Co-Chair Carlos Gonzalez Gutierrez (General Consulate of Mexico in San Diego), Vice Chair Ibarra, Jose Marquez (Caltrans District 11), Denice Garcia (City of San Diego), Monica Morales (City of Tijuana), Justin Kozo (County of San Diego), Consul General Sue Saarnio (General Counsel of the United States in Tijuana), Natah Owens (Global Connect), Rodolfo Argote (IMPLAN), Kenia Zamarripa (San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce), Gustavo de la Fuente (Smart Border Coalition), Laura Araujo (Tijuana Innovadora), Greg Malliger (UC San Diego), and Lorena Lopez-Powers (U.S. EPA).

No: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: City of Chula Vista, City of Imperial Beach, City of Pacific Beach, Colegio de la Frontera, Fundación Internacional de la Comunidad, A. C., San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce, Otay Mesa Chamber of Commerce, Gobierno de Baja California, U.S. Cross-Border Protection Agency. WILD Coast/COSTASALVAJE.

### **3. Public Comments/Communications/Member Comments**

Co-Chair González provided an update on the current status of the COVID-19 pandemic and its effects on both the Hispanic community in San Diego and the border community. Consul González also reported on the Transboundary Flows coming from the Tijuana River Valley, declaring that the months of August and September had no transboundary flows; and noted that Otay Mesa East Port of Entry was classified as a Top Priority for Mexico's federal Infrastructure Plan.

## **Reports**

### **4. 2019 SANDAG Crossborder Travel Behavior Survey (Information)**

An update on the 2019 SANDAG Crossborder Travel Behavior Survey, which is being conducted to help inform planning and modeling efforts related to crossborder travel was presented.

## **5. Update on the Tijuana Municipal Urban Development Plan 2020-2040 (Information)**

An overview of an update to the City of Tijuana's Municipal Urban Development Plan 2020-2040 (known by its acronym PDUCEP in Spanish), which coordinates development and infrastructure for the population center of Tijuana within the context of social and economic factors was presented.

## **6. Crossborder Coordination for Public Health During COVID-19 (Information)**

An overview on various efforts to collaborate with and coordinate public health responses among agencies in both the United States and Mexico during the COVID-19 pandemic was presented.

## **7. Upcoming Meetings**

The next COBRO meeting is scheduled for Tuesday, December 1, 2020, at 3 p.m.

## **8. Adjournment**

Chair Ganster adjourned the COBRO meeting at 4:17 p.m.

## Confirmed Attendance at SANDAG Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities Meeting

October 6, 2020

Jurisdiction	Name	Attended	Comments
Institute for Reginal Studies of the Californias – SDSU	Paul Ganster, Chair	Yes	
	Bertha Hernández, Alternate	No	
Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego	Carlos González Gutiérrez, Co-Chair	Yes	
	Gaspar Orozco, Alternate	No	
South County Economic Development Council	Efraín Ibarra, Vice Chair	Yes	
	Jim O’Callaghan, Alternate	No	
	Cory Binns	No	
Caltrans	Jose Marquez, Alternate	Yes	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
City of Chula Vista	Miguel Tapia	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
City of Imperial Beach	Andrew Hall	No	
	Steve Dush, Alternate	No	
City of San Diego	Denice Garcia	Yes	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
City of Tijuana	Bernabé Esquer	No	Monica Morales attended
	Olivia Maldonado, Alternate	No	
Consulate General of the United States of America in Tijuana	Sue Saarnio	Yes	
	Bridgett Premont, Alternate	Yes	
County of San Diego	Justine Kozo	Yes	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
El Colegio de la Frontera Norte	Gabriela Muñoz	No	
	Lina Ojeda, Alternate	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
Fundación Internacional de la Comunidad, A. C.	Cecilia Luken	No	
	Yolanda Walther-Meade, Alternate	No	
Instituto de Planeación Municipal de Tijuana (IMPLAN)	Rodolfo Argote	Yes	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
	Alejandra Mier y Terán	No	
Otay Mesa Chamber of Commerce	Viviana Ibañez, Alternate	No	
	Jim Burritt, Alternate	No	
	Thomas Currie, Alternate	No	
San Diego Dialogue	Nathan Owens	Yes	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	

Jurisdiction	Name	Attended	Comments
San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce	Paola Ávila	No	
	Kenia Zamarripa, Alternate	Yes	
San Diego-Tijuana Smart Border Coalition	Gustavo de la Fuente	Yes	
	JC Thomas, Alternate	No	
San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce	Jason M-B Wells	No	
	Thomas Currie, Alternate	No	
State of Baja California	Mariano Escobedo	No	
	Vivian Salazar, Alternate	No	
Tijuana Innovadora	Laura Araujo	Yes	
	Hernando Durán, Alternate	Yes	
U.S. Customs and Border Protection Agency	Toby Sosbee	No	
	Jaclyn Cooper, Alternate	No	
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency	Hector Aguirre	No	
	Lorena Lopez, Alternate	Yes	
	Jeremy Bauer, Alternate	No	
U.S.-Mexican Studies at UC San Diego	Melissa Floca	No	Greg Malliger attended
	Denise Moreno-Ducheny, Alternate	No	
WILDCOAST/COSTASALVAJE	Paloma Aguirre	No	
	Cristhabel Verdugo, Alternate	No	
<b>Advisory Members</b>			
City of Tecate	Juan Carlos Montiel	No	
	Gabriel Vázquez, Alternate	No	
Consejo de Desarrollo Económico de Tijuana (CDT)	Dennis LaSalle	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
Desarrollo Económico e Industrial de Tijuana (DEITAC)	David Mayagoitia	No	
	Adriana Eguía, Alternate	No	
San Diego County Water Authority	Elsa Saxod	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
San Diego Regional Economic Development Corporation	Vacant	N/A	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
Tijuana River National Estuarine Research Preserve	Ann Marie Tipton	No	
	Clay Phillips, Alternate	No	
	Mike McCoy, Alternate	No	
Universidad Iberoamericana Tijuana	Rodolfo Argote	Yes	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	



May 4, 2021

Action: **Approve**

### **February 26, 2021, Borders Committee and the Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities with Municipalities and State Government of Baja California Joint Meeting Minutes**

Borders Committee Chair Serge Dedina (South County) called the Borders Committee meeting to order at 12:32 p.m.

#### **1. Approval of Meeting Minutes**

This item was continued to a future meeting.

#### **2. Public Comments/Communications/Member Comments**

Chair Dedina welcomed meeting participants to the Joint Meeting of the Borders Committee and the Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) with Municipalities and State Government of Baja California. Ambassador Carlos González Gutiérrez, Consular General of Mexico in San Diego, acted as Co-Chair of this joint meeting.

Chair Dedina and Co-Chair Gonzalez Gutiérrez welcomed distinguished guests including Mexican partners representing the municipalities and State of Baja California, guests representing the federal governments of the U.S. and Mexico, SANDAG leadership, and introduced new members of the Borders Committee that were attending for the first time.

#### **3. Executive Director's Report (Discussion)**

Executive Director Hasan Ikhata welcomed everyone to the joint meeting and provided an update on key programs, projects, and agency initiatives.

Action: Discussion only.

### **Reports**

#### **4. Report from Consul General of Mexico (Information)**

Co-Chair González Gutiérrez provided an overview on binational activities within the purview of the Borders Committee.

Action: Information only.

#### **5. Impacts of Border Delays at the California – Baja California Land Ports of Entry Study (Information)**

Corridor Planning Manager Rachel Kennedy, Anthony Homan, HDR Inc., and Tom Kear, T. Kear Transportation Planning and Management, provided an overview of the Impacts of Border Delays at California – Baja California Land Ports of Entry study, which quantifies the economic and climate/air quality impacts resulting from delays in the crossborder movements of people and freight.

Action: Information only.

## **6. Otay Mesa East – Mesa de Otay II Port of Entry Project Updates (Information)**

Project Corridor Director Mario Orso, Caltrans, Capital Development Program Manager María Rodríguez, SANDAG, Director General of Highway Development Ricardo Erazo Garcia Cano and Special Projects Coordinator Erika Garcia, Secretariat of Communications and Transportation, Mexico, presented an update on the Otay Mesa East – Mesa de Otay II Port of Entry project.

Action: Information only.

## **7. Continued Public Comments**

None.

## **8. Upcoming Meetings (Information)**

The next Borders Committee meeting is scheduled for Friday, March 26, 2021, at 12:30 p.m.

## **9. Adjournment**

Chair Dedina adjourned the meeting at 2:39 p.m.

## Confirmed Attendance at SANDAG Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities Meeting

February 26, 2021

Jurisdiction	Name	Attended	Comments
Institute for Regional Studies of the Californias – SDSU	Paul Ganster, Chair	Yes	
	Bertha Hernández, Alternate	No	
Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego	Carlos González Gutiérrez, Co-Chair	Yes	Natalia Figueroa attended
	Gaspar Orozco, Alternate	No	
South County Economic Development Council	Efraín Ibarra, Vice Chair	No	
	Jim O’Callaghan, Alternate	No	
Caltrans	Cory Binns	No	
	Jose Marquez, Alternate	Yes	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
City of Chula Vista	Miguel Tapia	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
City of Imperial Beach	Andrew Hall	No	
	Steve Dush, Alternate	No	
City of San Diego	Denice Garcia	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
City of Tijuana	Monica Morales	Yes	
	Olivia Maldonado, Alternate	No	
Consulate General of the United States of America in Tijuana	Sue Saarnio	No	
	Bridgett Premont, Alternate	No	
County of San Diego	Justine Kozo	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
El Colegio de la Frontera Norte	Gabriela Muñoz	No	
	Lina Ojeda, Alternate	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
Fundación Internacional de la Comunidad, A. C.	Cecilia Luken	No	Anne McEnany attended
	Yolanda Walther-Meade, Alternate	No	
Instituto de Planeación Municipal de Tijuana (IMPLAN)	Rodolfo Argote	Yes	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
Otay Mesa Chamber of Commerce	Alejandra Mier y Terán	Yes	
	Viviana Ibañez, Alternate	No	
	Jim Burritt, Alternate	No	
	Thomas Currie, Alternate	No	
San Diego Dialogue	Nathan Owens	Yes	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	

Jurisdiction	Name	Attended	Comments
San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce	Paola Ávila	N/A	
	Kenia Zamarripa, Alternate	Yes	
San Diego-Tijuana Smart Border Coalition	Gustavo de la Fuente	Yes	
	JC Thomas, Alternate	No	
San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce	Jason M-B Wells	Yes	
	Thomas Currie, Alternate	No	
State of Baja California	Mariano Escobedo	No	
	Vivian Salazar, Alternate	Yes	
Tijuana Innovadora	Laura Araujo	Yes	
	Hernando Durán, Alternate	No	
U.S. Customs and Border Protection Agency	Toby Sosbee	No	
	Jaclyn Cooper, Alternate	No	
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency	Hector Aguirre	No	
	Doug Liden, Alternate	Yes	
	Lorena Lopez-Powers, Alternate	Yes	
U.S.-Mexican Studies at UC San Diego	Melissa Floca	No	
	Denise Moreno-Ducheny, Alternate	Yes	
WILDCOAST/COSTASALVAJE	Paloma Aguirre	No	Fay Crevoshay attended
	Cristhabel Verdugo, Alternate	No	
<b>Advisory Members</b>			
City of Tecate	Juan Carlos Montiel	No	
	Gabriel Vázquez, Alternate	No	
Consejo de Desarrollo Económico de Tijuana (CDT)	Dennis LaSalle	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
Desarrollo Económico e Industrial de Tijuana (DEITAC)	David Mayagoitia	No	
	Adriana Eguía, Alternate	No	
San Diego County Water Authority	Elsa Saxod	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
San Diego Regional Economic Development Corporation	Vacant	N/A	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
Tijuana River National Estuarine Research Preserve	Ann Marie Tipton	No	
	Clay Phillips, Alternate	No	
	Mike McCoy, Alternate	No	
Universidad Iberoamericana Tijuana	Rodolfo Argote	Yes	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	

May 4, 2021

Action: **Approve**

### **March 26, 2021, Joint Meeting of the Borders Committee and the Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities Meeting Minutes**

Borders Committee Vice Chair Vivian Moreno (City of San Diego) called the joint meeting of the Borders Committee and Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) to order at 12:34 p.m.

#### **1. Approval of Meeting Minutes (Approval)**

Action: Upon a motion by Vice Chair Vivian Moreno (City of San Diego) and a second by Mayor Paul McNamara (North County Inland), the Borders Committee approved the minutes from its January 22, 2021, and February 26, 2021, meetings.

The motion passed.

Yes: Vice Chair Moreno, Supervisor Joel Anderson (County of San Diego), Dave Drucker (North County Coastal), and Mayor McNamara.

No: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: East County, Imperial County, and South County.

#### **2. Public Comments/Communications/Member Comments**

Vice Chair Moreno welcomed meeting participants to the special joint meeting of the Borders Committee and the COBRO. Dr. Paul Ganster, COBRO Chair, acted as Co-Chair of this joint meeting.

Vice Chair Moreno provided welcoming remarks that highlighted the elections of last year, the COVID-19 pandemic, the resulting economic crisis, and social struggles that have signaled the need for serious changes.

Co-Chair Ganster provided welcoming remarks, background on the role and function of COBRO, and acknowledged COBRO members attending the meeting.

Executive Director Mark Baza, Imperial County Transportation Commission announced that the ICTC Board had approved a design-build contract to carry out the Calexico East Bridge Widening Project.

Action: Discussion only.

#### **3. Executive Director's Report (Discussion)**

Chief Planning & Innovation Officer Ray Traynor welcomed everyone to the joint meeting and provided an update on key programs, projects, and agency initiatives, including San Diego Forward: The 2021 Regional Plan.

Action: Discussion only.

## Reports

### 4. Planning Across the California – Baja California Border (Information)

Co-Chair Ganster presented a brief report on pertinent issues related to planning in the border region.

Action: Information only.

### 5. California – Baja California 2021 Border Master Plan (Information)

International Border Relations and Freight Mobility Branch Chief Jose Marquez, Caltrans, provided an overview on highlights and key findings of the California–Baja California 2021 Border Master Plan.

Action: Information only.

### 6. The California – Baja California BMP Website and Story Map (Information)

Senior Research Analyst Cheryl Mason, SANDAG Service Bureau, presented an overview of the California-Baja California Border Master Plan (BMP) Story Map, a web based tool developed as part of the 2021 BMP, containing high-level trade and border crossing statistics, innovative ideas for managing the binational transportation system, project mapping, BMP recommendations, and links to the BMP website.

Action: Information only.

### 7. Update on the State Route 11 and future Otay Mesa East Port of Entry Project (Information)

Project Corridor Director Mario Orso, Caltrans, and Capital Development Program Manager María Rodríguez, SANDAG, provided an overview of the State Route 11 and the future Otay Mesa East Port of Entry project and activities.

Action: Information only.

### 8. Continued Public Comments

None.

### 9. Upcoming Meetings (Information)

The next Borders Committee meeting is scheduled for Friday, April 23, 2021, at 12:30 p.m.

### 10. Adjournment

Vice Chair Moreno adjourned the meeting at 2:08 p.m.

## Confirmed Attendance at SANDAG Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities Meeting

March 26, 2021

Jurisdiction	Name	Attended	Comments
Institute for Reginal Studies of the Californias – SDSU	Paul Ganster, Chair	Yes	
	Bertha Hernández, Alternate	No	
Consulate General of Mexico in San Diego	Carlos González Gutiérrez, Co-Chair	No	
	Natalia Figueroa, Alternate	Yes	
South County Economic Development Council	Efraín Ibarra, Vice Chair	No	
	Jim O’Callaghan, Alternate	Yes	
Caltrans	Cory Binns	No	
	Jose Marquez, Alternate	Yes	
	Mario Orso, Alternate	Yes	
City of Chula Vista	Miguel Tapia	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
City of Imperial Beach	Andrew Hall	No	
	Steve Dush, Alternate	No	
City of San Diego	Denice Garcia	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
City of Tijuana	Monica Morales	Yes	
	Olivia Maldonado, Alternate	No	
Consulate General of the United States of America in Tijuana	Sue Saarnio	No	
	Bridgett Premont, Alternate	Yes	
County of San Diego	Justine Kozo	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
El Colegio de la Frontera Norte	Gabriela Muñoz	No	
	Lina Ojeda, Alternate	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
Fundación Internacional de la Comunidad, A. C.	Cecilia Luken	No	
	Anne McEnany, Alternate	Yes	
Instituto de Planeación Municipal de Tijuana (IMPLAN)	Alejandro Ruiz		
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
Otay Mesa Chamber of Commerce	Alejandra Mier y Terán	No	
	Viviana Ibañez, Alternate	No	
	Jim Burritt, Alternate	No	
	Thomas Currie, Alternate	No	
San Diego Dialogue	Nathan Owens	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	

Jurisdiction	Name	Attended	Comments
San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce	Kenia Zamarripa	Yes	
	Vacant, Alternate	No	
San Diego-Tijuana Smart Border Coalition	Gustavo de la Fuente	Yes	
	JC Thomas, Alternate	No	
San Ysidro Chamber of Commerce	Jason M-B Wells	No	
	Thomas Currie, Alternate	No	
State of Baja California	Mariano Escobedo	No	
	Vivian Salazar, Alternate	No	
Tijuana Innovadora	Laura Araujo	Yes	
	Hernando Durán, Alternate	No	
U.S. Customs and Border Protection Agency	Toby Sosbee	No	
	Jaclyn Cooper, Alternate	No	
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency	Hector Aguirre	No	
	Lorena Lopez, Alternate	Yes	
U.S.-Mexican Studies at UC San Diego	Jeremy Bauer, Alternate	No	
	Melissa Floca	No	
WILDCOAST/COSTASALVAJE	Denise Moreno-Ducheny, Alternate	No	
	Paloma Aguirre	No	
	Cristhabel Verdugo, Alternate	No	
Advisory Members			
City of Tecate	Juan Carlos Montiel	No	
	Gabriel Vázquez, Alternate	No	
Consejo de Desarrollo Económico de Tijuana (CDT)	Dennis LaSalle	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
Desarrollo Económico e Industrial de Tijuana (DEITAC)	David Mayagoitia	No	
	Adriana Eguía, Alternate	No	
San Diego County Water Authority	Elsa Saxod	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
San Diego Regional Economic Development Corporation	Vacant	N/A	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	
Tijuana River National Estuarine Research Preserve	Ann Marie Tipton	No	
	Clay Phillips, Alternate	No	
	Mike McCoy, Alternate	No	
Universidad Iberoamericana Tijuana	Rodolfo Argote	No	
	Vacant, Alternate	N/A	



May 4, 2021

Action: **Information**

## **2021 California-Baja California Border Master Plan Recommendations**

### **Introduction**

An overview of the recently released California–Baja California 2021 Border Master Plan (BMP) was presented to the Borders Committee and Committee on Binational Regional Opportunities (COBRO) at its meeting on March 26, 2021. The BMP is a comprehensive, binational approach to coordinate planning and delivery of land ports of entry (POEs) and transportation infrastructure projects serving those POEs in the California-Baja California border region. The U.S.–Mexico Joint Working Committee (JWC), led by the U.S. Federal Highway Administration (FHWA) and Mexico’s Secretariat of Communications and Transportation (SCT), provided leadership for the effort. Caltrans developed the 2021 BMP in partnership with the State of Baja California Secretariat of Infrastructure, Urban Development, and Territorial Reorganization (SIDURT); with consultant assistance from the SANDAG Service Bureau and its subconsultant, IBI Group; and with technical support from the HNTB Corporation.

### **Discussion**

During the meeting, Caltrans proposed an idea to “Adopt a BMP Recommendation.” This idea came from the Caltrans Adopt-A-Highway Program, which provides an avenue for individuals, organizations, or businesses to help maintain sections of roadside within California’s State Highway System. Groups have the option to participate as volunteers or to hire a maintenance service provider to perform the work on their behalf. Caltrans is interested in establishing the “Adopt a BMP Recommendation” as a way to engage stakeholder groups in the BMP and to advance work on the recommendations.

This report focuses on the recommendations of the 2021 BMP (Attachment 1). Staff will discuss the recommendations with the COBRO and gather input to help develop a process to advance this concept.

The full report, technical appendix, and executive summary in English and Spanish are available under “Reports” on the [BMP website](#).

### **Next Steps**

Based on the input gathered from COBRO, Caltrans will develop a process to implement the “Adopt a BMP Recommendation” and share it with the Borders Committee at an upcoming meeting.

Key Staff Contact: Hector Vanegas, (619) 699-1972, [hector.vanegas@sandag.org](mailto:hector.vanegas@sandag.org)

Attachment: 1. Recommendations of the California-Baja California 2021 Border Master Plan

## Chapter 8

### Recommendations

---

The California–Baja California BMP was first envisioned by the U.S.–Mexico Joint Working Committee (JWC) as a pilot project to improve the binational coordination on planning and delivery of land ports of entry (POEs) and transportation projects serving those POEs across the entire U.S.–Mexico border. The pilot study was completed in 2008 and the plan was updated in 2014. This effort in the California–Baja California region was the first binational prioritization process for border planning that included a methodology for ranking POE and related infrastructure projects that was accepted binationally. Based on the successes of the BMP, the California–Baja California approach was adopted by other border regions and customized to address their needs. Since the 2008 BMP, border states in the United States and Mexico have completed the Arizona–Sonora, New Mexico–Chihuahua, and Texas–Mexico BMPs.

This chapter provides recommendations to maintain and enhance the border master planning process and support the goals of the California–Baja California 2021 BMP, which are to:

1. Maintain and strengthen binational coordination via the U.S.–Mexico JWC and the Binational Bridges and Border Crossing Group.
2. Expand outreach to community groups and private-sector stakeholders in the border region to learn about their concerns and gain additional insights on border region issues.
3. Review the status of the recommendations from previous BMPs.
4. Develop a process to manage the border as one system consisting of coordinated ports of entry in the California–Baja California Border Region, considering current innovative efforts of stakeholders.
5. Identify and address regional mobility impacts of crossborder traffic on border communities.
6. Update new policy and/or legislative issues and funding trends and opportunities impacting planning and capital improvement in the BMP study area. Identify and seek ongoing long-range sustainable funding sources to provide an ongoing BMP process.
7. Encourage ongoing communication amongst participating agencies by upgrading the existing online data portal an updatable data source for partner agency information sharing.

#### 2021 Recommendations

As a starting point, the recommendations from the California–Baja California 2014 BMP were reviewed to monitor the status of their implementation and to identify recommendations to carry forward into the 2021 BMP. The recommendations also incorporated considerations from the innovative strategies, white papers, surveys, and various stakeholder feedback (Table 8.1).

**Table 8.1**  
**2021 BMP Recommendations**

#	Recommendation	Description
<b>1</b>	<b>Establish Process for Future Updates and Maintain Binational Coordination</b>	
1.1	Develop an annual BMP status report	This status report should include information on border metrics such as border wait times, performance metrics, project data updates, and information from the data portal. As part of this effort, annual meetings may be convened to report on project updates and amendments. An annual survey may be conducted in place of or in addition to an annual meeting. Updates collected from the meeting/survey will be used to inform an annual BMP status report. These annual status reports may serve as inputs to the annual and five-year work plans.
1.2	Develop process for five-year and annual work plans for the BMP	Work plans may include priorities and phased actions by year given the recommendations in each BMP update.
1.3	Identify funding opportunities for future BMP updates and establish tracking process	Funding opportunities to specifically fund the BMP will be identified and tracked to allow the BMP update to be conducted every four to six years. An approach for developing a U.S.–Mexico border-wide BMP funding strategy with other agencies/entities should be discussed as appropriate.
1.4	Identify new policy and/or legislating issues, trends, and funding realities and opportunities impacting the BMP	Explore opportunities for aligning the BMP with federal and state initiatives.
1.5	Incorporate planning efforts by other agencies into the BMP process	This may include border times estimation, air quality, transportation assessments, and economic analyses.
1.6	Encourage agencies to incorporate sustainability principles into their planning studies and efforts	Agencies should include sustainability elements and sections in planning studies, efforts, and initiatives that involve the border region.

## 2 Expand Border Collaboration and Coordination

- |   |   |
|---|---|
| 2.1. Explore crossborder collaboration and identify framework options | This may include a study of the methods and approaches to crossborder collaboration and coordination, including areas of challenges and opportunities and methods for improvement. It should also include a review of viable options for an improved binational management structure that recognizes the roles and authority of agency stakeholders while providing a framework for regular regional proactive collaboration. The framework could include support for jurisdictions and agencies with limited staffing to participate in working toward binational goals. |
| 2.2. Explore opportunities for binational public outreach             | Explore ways to maintain close coordination among federal, state, regional, and local agencies and municipalities to both conduct more public outreach and inform and address border community concerns.  |
| 2.3. Conduct border region studies to address environmental justice   | Suggestions include an assessment of the economy and a market-segment based review of border users' characteristics, needs, and behaviors to inform equitable distribution of the funds so future plans and efforts may properly address the needs at the border  |
| 2.4. Establish binational performance metrics                         | Performance metrics may include those related to transportation, environment, and environmental justice and those linked to BMP goals and funding opportunities.  |
| 2.5. Explore the opportunity for crossborder transit service          | Consider the roles and responsibilities of the agencies and third parties involved and identify barriers to implementation.   |

## 3 Manage the Border as a System

- |  |   |
|--|---|
| 3.1. Continue to collaborate with border agencies through the U.S.–Mexico Border Forecasting Peer Exchange to harmonize and share information on data collection and forecasting methodologies | This data may include crossborder travel demand by mode, and other crossborder-related transportation data, such as border wait times, approach lane management, traveler information, modal options, incident detection and response, video analytics, and final inspection lane approach management. Information from the future Border Wait Time System should be included. A process for a binational border data warehouse can be established. |
|--|---|

California–Baja California  
2021 Border Master Plan

3.2	Establish border management framework	Establish roles and responsibilities of technical staff from state and regional agencies. The framework will need to integrate with numerous systems across multiple stakeholders on both sides of the border. The use of data in terms of privacy and security will need to be considered.
3.3	Establish border performance monitoring system	This system could draw on data from a variety of sources, including border traffic management systems, traveler information, community feedback, and border wait time systems to collect, analyze, determine trends, and summarize key performance data at the border. Public facing and agency internal facing dashboards could be developed for easy access to key information. Careful consideration should be given to the relationships between key performance indicators (KPIs) and operational goals for individual agencies performing tasks at the border.
3.4	Consider options for border network operational efficiency	This might include consideration of the following: flexible hours of operations responding to demand, dynamic lane operations.
<b>4 Promote Multimodal Access for People at the Border</b>		
4.1	Expand mode shift and transit access opportunities and connections	This may include strategies for first and last mile that increase options for access to a POE other than via a motorized vehicle. These may include scooter or bikesharing, bicycle network upgrades, Smart Mobility Hubs, pedestrian and cyclist amenities, and real-time information.
4.2	Explore pilot opportunities for those crossing on foot	This may further explore opportunities and options for implementation of the Smart Pathway concept at POEs to facilitate efficient and secure processing.
<b>5 Promote Ease of Goods Movement</b>		
5.1	Explore opportunities for piloting and implementing efficient inspection technologies at POEs	This may include exploring the piloting and implementation of technologies like non-intrusive inspection (NII), unified cargo processing (UCP), and other infrastructure for secure and efficient processing of cargo
5.2	Explore opportunities for pre-crossing technologies	This may include a tracking and tracing system, a modified C-TPAT/FAST program from time-sensitive shipments, and crossing reservations that can ease the process for trucks prior to crossing.

- |     |  |  |
|-----|--|--|
| 5.3 | Explore opportunities for electrified trucks | Consider infrastructure needed for electrified trucks in the future, this may include electrified trucks stops and charging areas. |
|-----|--|--|

## 6 Provide Framework and Prioritization for Border Efforts

- |     |  |   |
|-----|--|---|
| 6.1 | Develop prioritized white papers for future border enhancements              | Prioritize border-related white papers exploring technology and mode enhancements that may serve as precursors to follow-on work. This may include developing preliminary scopes of work that include timelines and context for interaction with the BMP. |
| 6.2 | Develop a scope of work for a binational transportation model                | This may include performance metrics and the incorporation of key planning studies  |
| 6.3 | Reevaluate criteria for border projects                                      | This might include the evaluation criteria for projects, strategies, and policies.  |
| 6.4 | Explore opportunities and expand functionality of the data portal            | Build on the progress made on the data portal and continue to expand functionality to benefit future BMP updates and border-related agencies for project identification and prioritization  |
| 6.5 | Identify and continually track funding opportunities for binational projects | This includes identifying funding opportunities and setting up an effort to continually track those opportunities   |