

December 10, 2021, Board of Directors Meeting Minutes

Chair Catherine Blakespear (City of Encinitas) called the meeting of the Board of Directors to order at 9 a.m.

Action: Approve

The Board of Directors is asked to approve the minutes from its December 10, 2021, meeting.

Reports

2. 2021 Regional Plan and Final Environmental Impact Report (Adopt)

Director of Regional Planning Coleen Clementson presented the item.

Paul Collier, member of the public, spoke in support of a potential road usage charge.

Debbie Bailey, member of the public, spoke in opposition to a potential road usage charge.

Greg Brown, member of the public, spoke in opposition to the Regional Plan and regarding urban vs. suburban and rural transportation planning.

Dan Summers, member of the public, spoke regarding safety concerns for the Ramona community.

Payson Stevens, member of the public, spoke regarding safety concerns for the Del Mar Bluffs.

Karl Aldinger, Sierra Club San Diego, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Haney Hong, San Diego County Taxpayers Association (SDCTA), spoke regarding the good governance recommendations issued by the SDCTA as they relate to decision-making around support or opposition to the Regional Plan.

Rich Martindell, member of the public, spoke in opposition to a potential road usage charge.

Barry Pollard, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Bill Tippits, Southwest Wetlands, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Laura Hunter, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Haneen Mohamed, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Pamela Heatherington, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Steve Gelb, member of the public, spoke regarding climate change and in support of the Regional Plan.

Karen Sutton, League of Women Voters, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Craig Jones, Social Equity Working Group (SEWG) member, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Bret Schanzenbach, member of the public, spoke in opposition to a potential road usage charge.

Diane Panella, member of the public, spoke in opposition to a potential road usage charge.

Katie Meyer, member of the public, spoke regarding climate change and in support of the Regional Plan.

Toshi Ishihara member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan and the 10 Transit Lifelines.

Will Rhatigan, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Phil Petree, ICEJSD, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Mykone Rasabout, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Frank Landis, member of the public, spoke regarding concerns around plans to add additional freeway lanes near Rose Canyon.

Katherine Harrison, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

David Guerrero, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan and regarding the need for additional transit amenities, such as bathrooms.

Tony Perna, member of the public, spoke in opposition to public transit and potential road usage charges.

Gretchen Newsome, IBEW569, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Anjal Vaidya, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Nastassia Patin, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Katie Crist, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Carolina Martinez, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Chris Nielsen, member of the public, spoke regarding concerns around plans to add additional freeway lanes near Rose Canyon.

Prasad Naga, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan

Gary Myers, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Cristina Marquez, IBEW569, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Kinshuk Chatterjee, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Noah Harris, Climate Action Campaign, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Suzanne Hume, Clean Earth for Kids, spoke regarding air quality concerns and in support of the Regional Plan.

Michael Beck, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Susan Cohen, member of the public, spoke in opposition to a potential road usage charge.

Gary Lomayesva, member of the public, spoke regarding project funding concerns.

Karina Gonzalaz, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Hannah Gbeh, Farm Bureau, spoke in opposition to the Regional Plan.

Rita Clement, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Christopher Allen, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan and regarding the need for additional infrastructure improvements.

Ariana, SEWG member, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Matthew, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan and expressed concerns about ridership numbers.

Goyo Ortiz, CASA Familiar, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Josh Coyne, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

CASA Familiar spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Ana Chiquete, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Lisa Cuestas, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Erma Nunez, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

A member of the public with the phone # ending in 030 spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Belen Hernandez, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Celia Barajas Ochoa, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan and needed investments in the San Ysidro area.

Manuela Castaneda, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan and needed investments in the San Ysidro area.

Andy Sturm, CASA Familiar, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Denisse Lopez, member of the public, spoke regarding extension of the Youth Opportunity Pass Pilot Program.

Magdalena Cerda, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Jesse Ramirez, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Silvia Calzada, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Maritza Garcia, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Alicia Sanchez, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Nicole Burgess, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Bee Mittermiller, San Diego 350, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Elizabeth Chavez Carrasco, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

John Iler, member of the public, spoke in opposition to a potential road usage charge.

Laura Benevidas, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Breanne Lash, SEWG member, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Kiara O'Laughlin, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Amy Randel, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Mike Bullock, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Marc Narkus-Kramer, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Randy Torres Van Vleck, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Jacob Mandel, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Bertha Rodriguez, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Susan Orlofsky, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Daniel Smiechowski, member of the public, spoke regarding concerns around ridership numbers.

Ramon Bieri, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Esperanza Gonzalez, Environmental Health Coalition, spoke regarding slow transit times and in support of the Regional Plan.

Kyle K, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan and regarding air quality concerns.

Cherry Diefenbach, member of the public, spoke regarding concerns around the data used in the Regional Plan.

Robert Lewis, member of the public, spoke in opposition to the Regional Plan.

Deborah Knight, friends of Rose Canyon, urged the Board to remove plans to add additional freeway lanes in the Rose Canyon area.

Rosa Lopez, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan and the 10 Transit Lifelines.

Roddy Jerome, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Nathan White, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Eric Christen, member of the public, spoke in opposition to Community Benefit Agreements.

Maureen, member of the public, spoke in opposition to the Regional Plan and urban vs. suburban and rural planning.

Brisa Aviles, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Rebecca, member of the public, spoke in opposition to a potential road usage charge.

Montserrat Hernandez, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Beatriz Salcedo, member of the public, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Savannah O'Toole, San Diego 350, spoke in support of the Regional Plan.

Action: A motion was made by Vice Chair Gloria (City of San Diego) and seconded by Second Vice Chair Sotelo-Solis (City of National City), to adopt Resolution Nos. 2022-09 and 2022-10 per the staff recommendation.

A substitute motion was made by Councilmember Christopher Rodriguez (City of Oceanside), with a second by Mayor Matt Hall (City of Carlsbad), to extend the adoption timeline for 90 days and commission a regional survey on the Regional Plan and Environmental Impact Report (EIR).

The motion failed.

Yes: Mayor Hall, Mayor Richard Bailey (City of Coronado), Mayor Bill Wells (City of El Cajon), Councilmember Rodriguez, Councilmember John Mullin (City of Poway), Mayor Rebecca Jones (City of San Marcos), and Mayor Judy Ritter (City of Vista).

No: Chair Blakespear, Vice Chair Gloria, Second Vice Chair Sotelo-Solis, Mayor Mary Salas (City of Chula Vista), Supervisor Terra Lawson-Remer (County of San Diego), Mayor Terry Gaasterland (City of Del Mar), Mayor Paul McNamara (City of Escondido), Councilmember Paloma Aguirre (City of Imperial Beach), Councilmember Jack Shu (City of La Mesa), Councilmember George Gastil (City of Lemon Grove), Mayor John Minto (City of Santee), and Mayor Lesa Heebner (City of Solana Beach).

Abstain: None.

Absent: None.

The Board of Directors voted on the original motion, to:

1. Adopt Resolution No. 2022-09, certifying that the Final EIR for San Diego Forward: The 2021 Regional Plan (Regional Plan) has been completed in compliance with the California Environmental Quality Act (Public Resources Code §21000 et seq.), that the Final EIR was presented to, reviewed, and considered by the Board of Directors prior to approving the Project, and that the Final EIR reflects the independent judgment and analysis of SANDAG; and adopting the Findings, Statement of Overriding Considerations, and Mitigation Monitoring and Reporting Program; and
2. Adopt Resolution No. 2022-10, adopting the air quality conformity determination, finding that the Sustainable Communities Strategy (SCS) achieves the regional greenhouse gas reduction targets established by the California Air Resources Board, and adopting San Diego Forward: the 2021 Regional Plan, including its SCS, its supporting analyses, and the Series 14 Regional Growth Forecast.

The motion passed.

Yes: Chair Blakespear, Vice Chair Gloria, Second Vice Chair Sotelo-Solis, Mayor Salas, Supervisor Lawson-Remer, Mayor Gaasterland, Mayor McNamara, Councilmember Aguirre, Councilmember Shu, Councilmember Gastil, and Mayor Heebner.

No: Mayor Hall, Mayor Bailey, Mayor Wells, Councilmember Rodriguez, Councilmember Mullin, Mayor Jones, Mayor Minto, and Mayor Ritter.

Abstain: None.

Absent: None.

3. Potential Future Update to 2021 Regional Plan (Discussion/Possible Action)

Coleen Clementson presented the item.

Michael Winn, member of the public, spoke regarding public involvement in planning.

Craig Jones spoke in support of a road usage charge as a replacement to the gas tax.

Alex Wong, member of the public, spoke in opposition to free transit and the Central Mobility Hub, and in support of other types of public transportation.

Mike Bullock spoke in support of a potential road usage charge.

Savannah O'Toole spoke in opposition to a potential road usage charge.

Phil Petree spoke in support of leaving all funding options in the Regional Plan.

Noah Harris spoke in support of leaving all funding options in the Regional Plan.

Rita Clement spoke in support of leaving all funding options in the Regional Plan.

Mary, member of the public, spoke in opposition to the Regional Plan and any potential new taxes.

Kathryn Rhodes, member of the public, spoke regarding regional water quality.

Katie Meyer spoke in support of leaving all funding options in the Regional Plan.

Prasad Naga spoke in support of leaving all funding options in the Regional Plan.

Bee Mittermiller spoke in support of leaving all funding options in the Regional Plan and regarding misinformation around potential road usage charges.

Nicole Burgess spoke in support of leaving all funding options in the Regional Plan.

Tim Bilash spoke in support of leaving all funding options in the Regional Plan.

Greg Brown, member of the public, spoke regarding needed investments in East County.

Action: Upon a motion by Vice Chair Gloria and a second by Chair Blakespear, and with a friendly amendment from Councilmember Shu to include specific language around equity, the Board of Directors directed staff to immediately begin evaluation of a potential update to the 2021 Regional Plan for Board consideration, including evaluating alternatives to the regional road usage charge program, staying with our values, upholding equity and other mechanisms that reduce pollution faster. Staff will report back to the Board within six months.

The motion passed.

Yes: Chair Blakespear, Vice Chair Gloria, Second Vice Chair Sotelo-Solis, Mayor Salas, Mayor Bailey, Supervisor Lawson-Remer, Mayor Gaasterland, Mayor McNamara, Councilmember Aguirre, Councilmember Shu, Councilmember Gastil, Councilmember Mullin, and Mayor Heebner.

No: None.

Abstain: None.

Absent: City of Carlsbad, City of El Cajon, City of Oceanside, City of San Marcos, City of Santee, and City of Vista.

1. Public Comments/Communications*

**This item was taken out of order*

Mike Bullock spoke regarding fees vs. taxes on public commodities.

Kathryn Rhodes spoke regarding potential locations for a Central Mobility Hub, and available funding for hotel rooms for San Diego residents experiencing homelessness.

David Baron, member of the public, spoke regarding potential effects of road usage charges on small business owners.

3. Member Comments

This item was continued to a future meeting.

4. Upcoming Meetings (Information)

The next Board of Directors meeting is scheduled for Friday, December 17, 2021, at 9 a.m.

5. Adjournment

Chair Blakespear adjourned the meeting at 12:46 p.m.

Confirmed Attendance at Board of Directors Meeting

December 10, 2021

Board of Directors	Title	Name	Attend Virtually
City of Carlsbad	Mayor	Matt Hall (Primary)	Yes
City of Chula Vista	Mayor	Mary Salas (Primary)	Yes
City of Coronado	Mayor	Richard Bailey (Primary)	Yes
County of San Diego	Supervisor	Terra Lawson-Remer (Primary)	Yes
County of San Diego	Supervisor	Joel Anderson (Primary)	Yes
City of Del Mar	Mayor	Terry Gaasterland (Primary)	Yes
City of El Cajon	Mayor	Bill Wells (Primary)	Yes
City of Encinitas	Mayor	Catherine Blakespear (Primary)	Yes
City of Escondido	Mayor	Paul McNamara (Primary)	Yes
City of Imperial Beach	Councilmember	Paloma Aguirre (2nd Alt.)	Yes
City of La Mesa	Councilmember	Jack Shu (Primary)	Yes
City of Lemon Grove	Councilmember	Jennifer Mendoza (1st Alt.)	Yes
City of National City	Second Vice Chair	Alejandra Sotelo-Solis (Primary)	Yes
City of Oceanside	Councilmember	Christopher Rodriguez (Primary)	Yes
City of Poway	Councilmember	John Mullin (2nd Alt.)	Yes
City of San Diego	Vice Chair	Todd Gloria (Primary)	Yes
City of San Diego	Council President	Sean Elo-Rivera (Primary)	Yes
City of San Marcos	Mayor	Rebecca Jones (Primary)	Yes
City of Santee	Mayor	John Minto (Primary)	Yes
City of Solana Beach	Mayor	Lesia Heebner (Primary)	Yes
City of Vista	Mayor	Judy Ritter (Primary)	Yes
Caltrans		Gustavo Dallarda (1st Alt.)	Yes
Metropolitan Transit System	Councilmember	Paloma Aguirre (Primary)	Yes
North County Transit District	NCTD Chair	Tony Kranz (Primary)	Yes
Imperial County	Supervisor	Sup. Jesus Escobar (Primary)	No
U.S. Department of Defense	Executive Director	Dennis Keck (Primary)	Yes
Port of San Diego	Commissioner	Garry Bonelli (Primary)	Yes
San Diego County Water Authority	Councilmember	Mel Katz (Primary)	Yes
San Diego County Regional Airport Authority		Gil Cabrera (Primary)	Yes
Mexico	Consul General	Carlos González Gutiérrez (Primary)	No
SCTCA	Chair	Erica Pinto	Yes