

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE

March 5, 2004

AGENDA ITEM NO.: **1-B**

Action Requested: APPROVE

TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE DISCUSSION AND ACTIONS

Meeting of February 20, 2004

The meeting of the Transportation Committee was called to order by Chair Joe Kellejian (North County Coastal) at 9:05 a.m. See attached attendance sheet for Transportation Committee member attendance.

1. PUBLIC COMMENTS/COMMUNICATIONS/MEMBER COMMENTS

Chair Kellejian indicated that Mr. Walt Brewer, who has moved to Oregon, has sent a letter to the Transportation Committee. Those members who are interested in receiving this letter can request a copy of it.

Chuck Lungerhausen, a member of the public, indicated that Rincon Casino would double any donation made to the MS Society from Wednesday, February 18, 2004, until the MS Walk on March 13-14, 2004. He said that every donation is appreciated. Mr. Lungerhausen also commented on a recent newspaper article that stated that the San Diego Trolley is of little benefit to this region. He said that this conclusion came from someone who does not use public transit. Mr. Lungerhausen wondered how much worse would our congestion be today without the trolley and accompanying bus services.

Clive Richard, a member of the public, said that he read an article entitled, "The Great Rail Disaster," that was about alternatives to rail transit. It actually provided information on exactly what the San Diego region is doing. It stated that the alternative to rail transit is commuter rail and possibly other rail improvements. This brings us back to where we started. He said that the solution is to mix transportation modes because one mode will not solve all of the transportation challenges.

CONSENT ITEMS (3 through 5)

Chair Kellejian indicated that Item 2 has been pulled for discussion.

3. FINAL TRANSPORTATION DEVELOPMENT ACT (TDA) ADMINISTRATION POLICY (RECOMMEND)

TDA provides ¼ percent of State sales tax for operating and capital support of public transportation systems and nonmotorized transportation projects in the San Diego region. SANDAG, as the Regional Transportation Planning Agency, is responsible for administering the program. At the January 14, 2004, Transportation Committee meeting, staff presented

the draft Transportation Development Act Administration Policy. SANDAG received two requests for revisions to the Policy, one from the North County Transit District (NCTD) and one from the Bicycle-Pedestrian Working Group. These changes have been incorporated into the final Policy. The Transportation Committee is asked to recommend the adoption of the final TDA Administration Policy by the SANDAG Board.

4. 2004 STATE TRANSPORTATION IMPROVEMENT PROGRAM (STIP) ALTERNATIVES

The State Transportation Improvement Program is a five-year transportation funding program that is updated biennially. At the February 6, 2004, Transportation Committee meeting, staff obtained additional feedback on three options for the 2004 STIP. There were minor revisions requested, which have been incorporated into a Final Draft of the 2004 STIP. The Transportation Committee is asked to recommend that the Board of Directors approve the Final Draft 2004 STIP.

Action: Upon a motion by Councilmember Jim Madaffer (City of San Diego) and a second by Councilmember Jack Dale (East County), the Transportation Committee approved Consent Items 3 and 4.

2. CREATION OF A SANDAG TRANSIT ACCESS ADVISORY COMMITTEE (APPROVE)

Councilmember Madaffer asked who are the members of this committee and how are they appointed. *Staff indicated that the current members of the Trolley Access Advisory Committee (TAAC) at the Metropolitan Transit System (MTS) will be invited to join the committee at SANDAG.*

Councilmember Judy Ritter (NCTD) asked if this committee was for the MTS area or the North County area, or both. *Staff replied that NCTD is retaining its active Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) committee. This TAAC is only for MTS work being transferred to SANDAG.*

Councilmember Jerry Rindone (South County) suggested that it appears we are adding a committee and not consolidating committees. He hoped they could have a joint agenda. *Staff clarified that MTDB had two committees: the Accessible Services Advisory Committee (ASAC) and the TAAC. ASAC will deal with trolley and bus operations for MTS and TAAC will deal with bus and trolley facilities development at SANDAG. Staff further clarified that there are different people on these two committees, though there may be one liaison member who attends both committees. The Executive Director said that we have to get down to one TAAC to serve the region and it should be called a "working group." SANDAG staff will work with the accessible advisory committees to move toward the objective of one accessible working group for the San Diego region.*

Public Comment:

Clive Richard, a member of the public, said that ASAC is primarily concerned with the accessible services that are being provided and how the customer receives that service. TAAC is more concerned with how the facilities are actually designed to ensure that they are accessible.

Chair Kellejian commented that the new advisory working group will report to the Transportation Committee.

Councilmember Madaffer asked that the approval of this item be conditioned upon the intent of SANDAG to consolidate these efforts at some point in the future. *The Executive Director stated that staff will work with NCTD on the ongoing major construction projects in North County, and when the construction is completed, then we will look at consolidating the committees at that time.*

Action: Upon a motion by Vice Chair Mickey Cafagna (North County Inland) and a second by Councilmember Madaffer, the Transportation Committee approved the establishment of a Transit Access Advisory Committee at SANDAG to provide review of bus and trolley capital facilities development to ensure access by persons with disabilities, in compliance with the Americans with Disabilities Act, with approval conditioned upon staff working toward the consolidation of all of the accessible advisory committees into one regional working group.

REPORTS

6. TRANSIT OPERATING REVENUE ESTIMATES AND ALLOCATIONS (RECOMMEND)

Staff described the role of SANDAG as the consolidated agency on FY 2005 apportionments, FY 2006-2009 projections, and reviewing the allocation methodology for the federal formula funds. Staff also reviewed the sources of transit revenues, and provided a history of each funding source.

Supervisor Bill Horn (County of San Diego) questioned the allocation of TDA funds before and following consolidation. *Staff replied that the allocation of TDA revenue is the same both before and after consolidation; some functions and accompanying funding have been transferred from MTS and/or NCTD to SANDAG.*

The NCTD Executive Director clarified that a percentage of TDA funds has always come to SANDAG for planning purposes. Even though a majority of the planning efforts have been transferred from MTS and NCTD to SANDAG, the transit agencies retain an amount for administrative purposes. These are funds that MTS and NCTD previously received.

Paul Jablonski, MTS Executive Director, questioned the amount of funds being transferred to SANDAG. *Staff responded that a portion of the TDA funds is for various capital projects that are now going to be implemented by SANDAG. The important thing to note is that all of the projects contained in the capital program are included and are being implemented. The question is, which agency is going to implement them--MTS or SANDAG.*

Mr. Jablonski asked a question about the apportionment for administrative costs for MTS and NCTD. *Staff stated that the amount for these costs has been estimated and is subject to change as we work with NCTD and MTS on an equitable sharing of resources.*

Mayor Pro Tem Monroe (South County) asked for clarification about planning purposes. *Staff explained that the responsibility for all of the regional planning was transferred to SANDAG. The responsibility for local route planning and activities still rests with the transit*

agencies. We are still working through the Joint Committee on Regional Transit (JCRT) on service evaluation and fare setting policies, and will report back to the Committee and the Board with this information.

Councilmember Ritter asked about the impacts of service growth on the funding. *The Executive Director stated that as the Board deals with the issues, we have to work together to maximize mobility for the whole region. To the maximum extent possible we will keep to the formulas that have been historically used.*

Leon Williams, Chairman of the MTS Board, conveyed his feeling that the MTS Board did not have a clear understanding of the funding situation following consolidation. *Staff answered that when MTS worked on the TransNet formula change last year, the funding levels were agreed upon by MTS and SANDAG.*

Mr. Jablonski stated that with the implementation of the Mission Valley East Line, MTS may have expenses in excess of revenues. He wondered at what point you maintain money for planning and project development when you may not have sufficient funds to operate service.

Vice Chair Cafagna commented that part of consolidation was to streamline the function redundancy in all three agencies.

Councilmember Rindone stated that if you don't operate the transit system well, the public won't be interested in the planning efforts. The determination of funding and the division of responsibility is the essential element to ensure that consolidation is successful.

Councilmember Ritter stated that the goal of consolidation is to move people more efficiently.

Vice Chair Cafagna asked if personnel have been added as a result of consolidation. *The Executive Director replied that there have been a few positions but not a significant number. He also noted that we have been looking for opportunities to consolidate functions, and noted as an example that the General Counsel positions at SANDAG and MTS were consolidated.*

Chair Kellejian stated that Mayor Mary Sessom will be a voting member for this action representing the San Diego County Water Authority.

Action: Upon a motion by Councilmember Madaffer and a second by Vice Chair Cafagna, the Transportation Committee recommended that the Board of Directors: (1) adopt the FY 2005 apportionments, (2) approve the revenue projections for FY 2006 to FY 2009, and (3) direct staff to work with NCTD, MTS, and the JCRT to develop an equitable funding allocation methodology for federal formula-based funding.

5. CONGESTION MITIGATION STRATEGIES RESEARCH (APPROVE)

Staff stated that there are four components of the Regional Transportation Plan (RTP), related to the goals of the Congestion Mitigation Program (CMP): land use, systems development, demand management, and systems management. The process to identify

additional congestion mitigation strategies was reviewed. The research recommendations included three new categories of strategies: a toolbox of congestion mitigation strategies, a model trip reduction ordinance framework, and the trip reduction analysis guidelines. Each of these strategies was discussed in detail. Staff indicated that the proposed new CMP strategies can help local agencies evaluate and mitigate traffic impacts of new development projects, prepare CMP Deficiency Plans, and support other local congestion management programs. The recommendations were reviewed and endorsed by the San Diego Traffic Engineers Council, the Cities/County Transportation Advisory Committee, and the Regional Planning Technical Working Group.

Councilmember Madaffer asked who is using this data. *Staff said that agencies use these strategies in varying degrees. Local agencies should try and test out these strategies in their particular jurisdictions.*

Councilmember Madaffer inquired if local agencies are required to have the strategies, and if staff has provided this information to local agencies. *Staff replied that local agencies reviewed this information in the strategy development phase, and they were supportive of this concept.*

Councilmember Madaffer said that he would like to hear back on a city-by-city or region-by-region basis how these strategies have been used and resulted in lessened congestion. *The Executive Director said that the intent of this effort was to develop a ready toolbox that didn't previously exist to provide assistance to the local agencies. Staff can report back on the use of the toolbox.*

Vice Chair Cafagna suggested that staff develop reports with accompanying implementation plans so that we can measure the effectiveness of developing the information. *The Executive Director said that the purpose of this plan is to review deficiencies on a regular basis and have a strategy to work on those deficiencies.*

Supervisor Horn asked about violations. *Staff replied that there are two approaches: a voluntary approach that provides rewards for compliance, and a mandatory approach where certain things are required and fines and further regulation can be imposed for failure to meet the requirements.*

Councilmember Guerin asked about the possibility of developing subregional groups to work on the model trip reduction strategies. She also wondered how this would be addressed. *The Executive Director said that this effort fits in with the Regional Comprehensive Plan (RCP) work. The piece that is missing is to develop subregional plans. We have done some subregional planning in North County. Staff indicated that this is a great opportunity to track regional plans and use some of the tools to improve our commute. We will look at subregional plans and corridors and encourage the cities to get involved. The Executive Director added that the key to the success of these strategies is the link with the RCP. One of the rewards for compliance could be tied into transportation dollars. Staff noted that the format for the subregional plans is now being developed to be included in the final RCP. A number of cities are interested in this effort.*

Mayor Sessom said that these strategies can be used as criteria to incentivize jurisdictions. She was unclear how the strategies were developed. She asked if we will give appropriate

weight to the strategies when we look at incentives. *Staff stated that the strategies were developed from research obtained from across the nation. A workshop involving local agencies was held. We then went through each strategy and its objectives and came to a consensus. The Executive Director stated that when we start to develop how improvements are made, the Board and Transportation Committee can discuss development of the criteria.*

Mayor Pro Tem Monroe commented that we are not managing congestion appropriately. He doesn't see a lot of new information in this report. He thought that there are some new ideas that are not included in this report, for example, better ramp metering. There is nothing in the report that increases the capacity of the system.

Councilmember Emery (MTS) asked how these strategies will be invoked. *The Executive Director replied that at this point they are voluntary. He provided examples of how the strategies can be applied to local conditions.*

Staff noted that there is a range of possibilities and options, and not all are meant to work in each jurisdiction. Staff is willing to work with each jurisdiction to apply them in combinations or to modify them according to the particular situation. There are some new strategies included in this report; however, staff encouraged Committee members to inform staff if they find other new strategies that should be included in this document. We are working with public works directors and planners in the region to report back with project evaluation criteria that can be weighed, and policy makers can make the decision on the criteria.

Action: Upon a motion by Councilmember Emery and a second by Councilmember Madaffer, the Transportation Committee approved the amendment of the 2002 Congestion Management Program to incorporate the Congestion Mitigation Strategies Research results.

Chair Kellejian called a break at 10:40 a.m. and reconvened the meeting at 10:50 a.m.

7. DOWNTOWN SAN DIEGO COMPREHENSIVE TRANSIT STUDY AND COMMUNITY PLAN UPDATE (INFORMATION)

Staff reported that this study is being conducted as a parallel effort with the Centre City Development Corporation's (CCDC's) general plan update. The aim is to increase the role transit plays in the downtown San Diego area. The two key tasks are to develop a long-range transit vision for the community plan update, and develop a short-term phasing plan for Transit First Early Action projects. Staff noted that we are nearing completion of the first task.

Alexandra Elias from CCDC stated that they recognized that the important aspect about downtown San Diego is its accessibility from transit. CCDC started two years ago to develop a community plan. We have the opportunity to provide input on how downtown San Diego should grow in the future. She described CCDC's community outreach efforts for this study. The milestones achieved to date are: a preferred plan endorsed by the steering committee, the identification of parks, the development of a zoning philosophy, and the commencement of an implementation strategy. The next steps are to refine the preferred plan, develop a planned district ordinance, begin the Master Environmental Impact Report (MEIR) analysis, draft the plan documents, and release the study for public review.

Staff described the MOBILITY 2030 land use plan travel demand. The focus of planning efforts is on a long-range vision. There are a number of bus rapid transit (BRT) lines planned to come into the downtown San Diego area. There is a suggestion for a BRT tunnel, however, this would be a costly and complex effort, and is probably not a realistic option for the future. We need to determine which corridor is best suited for BRT: Market Street, Broadway, or B/C Streets. Three B/C Street alignment options were discussed along with the pros/cons of each. Alignment issues as well as parking garage and traffic impacts for the B/C Street options and at the Fifth Avenue Station were discussed. The conclusions are that all three B/C Street alternatives appear feasible, and further preliminary engineering studies are needed to further assess the traffic and design issues before selecting a preferred alternative.

Staff reported that the need for a downtown San Diego shuttle system was explored and two options were developed. One shuttle would primarily be used by workers and residents, and another would be oriented to the visitor/tourist market. For such a shuttle system to be successful, there are three key elements: service frequency every 10 minutes or better throughout the day, smaller vehicles that would fit into the residential areas, and service for people coming into downtown San Diego. One comment heard consistently is the need to upgrade the image of C Street. It is recognized that more attention is needed on transit design and customer amenities in the downtown San Diego area. Staff reviewed the conclusions for the long-range transit vision: a downtown shuttle and a trolley/BRT corridor. The next steps include further analysis of the B Street extension and development of capital and operating costs, and for the short-range phasing plan to analyze financing strategies for possible near-term shuttle service and a phasing strategy for Transit First Early Action BRT projects. Staff noted that the final version of this study will be presented later this fall for action.

Chair Kellejian commented that these proposed actions are linked to the passage of *TransNet*. *Staff agreed that the Transit First Early Action projects are linked to TransNet. It was noted that what happens in downtown San Diego affects other areas.*

Councilmember Madaffer thanked staff for the excellent and comprehensive report. He commented that one of the big problems of C Street is that it is essentially a "dead" street because of trolley operations. It is important to do this planning now.

Councilmember Rindone stated that some other cities (such as Washington, D.C.) have come up with a policy that penalizes businesses that provide incentives for employee-paid parking in the downtown areas. Continuing to pay for employee parking in these areas supports downtown congestion. The money used for that purpose should be provided as incentives for employees to use public transit. He asked staff to look at that type of policy and to report back.

Chair Kellejian mentioned that SANDAG has participated in the Diamond Awards, which are given to firms in San Diego County that encourage employee transit use. *Staff noted that on the CMP strategies, Exhibit 1 talks about parking restrictions.*

Councilmember Rindone said this should be tied into the marketing campaigns to educate businesses that supporting public transit is a benefit to all.

Councilmember Madaffer said that we need more infrastructure to get people to use transit. As we continue to evolve, this is exactly the target that we need to be achieving.

Ms. Elias cautioned the Committee about a policy of that nature. She thought it would only be beneficial on a regional basis. She added that we don't want to be a residential suburb to University Towne Centre (UTC) or Sorrento Valley. We are seeing residential and not employment areas being developed in the downtown San Diego area.

Public Comment:

Chuck Lungerhausen, a member of the public, stated that the question is will people get out of their cars or will the new vehicles increase the downtown San Diego congestion. He agreed that we need incentives to encourage new practices. He found that the transit system here in San Diego works. The system has to be expanded regionwide so everyone can get to downtown San Diego or get out to other areas. The service frequency is not going to encourage people to ride transit; however, increased transit frequency in the future will get people out of their cars.

Action: the Transportation Committee accepted this report for information.

8. FOLLOW-UP REPORT REGARDING COMPACT COMMITTEE REPORT ON "ALTERNATE STRATEGY FOR TRANSPORTATION INFRASTRUCTURE (ASTRIN) FUNDING" (INFORMATION)

Staff stated that this report had been deferred to staff for review. There are a lot of consistency between the principles contained in the report and the draft RCP. Staff noted that a written response to the COMPACT recommendations will be made as part of finalizing the RCP in the spring.

Bill Ferguson, Chair of COMPACT (Community Planners Advisory Committee on Transportation), said that communities are under stress due to the lack of transportation and infrastructure. As a result, COMPACT formed a subcommittee that came forward with the ASTRIN Report. This report will be forwarded to local, city, and state leaders as an alternative to multimodal transportation. funding for infrastructure is a matter of political will, and we need to fund a proposal that makes sense.

Morton Printz, Chair of the ASTRIN Subcommittee, indicated that the ASTRIN report contains six principles that COMPACT would like SANDAG to consider: (1) planning for a comprehensive transportation policy and plan should precede the planning for densification of population and development; (2) traffic and transportation planning must anticipate and meet the needs of commerce and population demands and shifts, both present and future; (3) major highway transportation corridors should be multi-functional and not restricted to only automobiles, motorbikes, or commercial vehicles; (4) transportation corridors should have a defined list of priorities regarding their accessibility, use and multi-functionality, etc.; (5) the level of acceptable congestion on major highways must be defined in advance since such roads cannot be expected to be congestion-free; and (6) transportation infrastructure planning improvements predicated upon Principles 1 through 5 would enhance both present and future tax revenue sources. Therefore, the burden of the costs would necessarily be shared between present and future sources in order to promote economic expansion and transportation efficacy.

Mr. Printz said that the conclusions of ASTRIN are that the essence of these principles can serve to guide development of a transportation infrastructure, using available funds which will permit congestion relief, set the city and county on the road to a 21st century transportation system, and insure the area greater economic growth and stability while preserving our unique ecosystem and environment. He stated that half of the vehicles on our freeways are trucks.

Chair Kellejian asked the Caltrans representative, Pedro Orso Delgado, about the amount of semi-trailer truck traffic on the freeways. Mr. Orso Delgado said that they are trying to validate the numbers but he thought it was 5-8 percent. Mr. Printz said that they figured one truck is counted as four cars, and that has to be taken into consideration. Mr. Ferguson stated that we have to address the issue of truck traffic and that element of our economy. Chair Kellejian stated that Caltrans uses three cars for every semi-truck, and we are trying to address truck traffic issues with our managed lanes concept.

Councilmember Madaffer invited the COMPACT representatives to attend the various SANDAG committee meetings to obtain more information about what SANDAG is involved in. He said that some things in the report merit continued discussion but he felt that the COMPACT representatives need to be well-grounded in the fiscal responsibilities this region is facing.

Mr. Ferguson said that the real question is, how hard are we going to fight politically for financial considerations from the federal government? It is a matter of having a focused effort towards a multimodal transportation element. We should be looking at a fiscal bundle to accomplish what needs to be done.

Vice Chair Cafagna stated his belief that some of these concepts, such as frontage roads, are very effective in keeping the traffic off of the freeways. However, he didn't know that we have the financial ability to do that. He suggested that SANDAG should seriously look at these principles.

Mayor Pro Tem Monroe said that the problem is we want trucks to come across the border in the early morning but the border is closed at that time. We need to work with U.S. Customs to get the border open. Mayor Pro Tem Monroe said that he would like a dialogue where we can compare theories.

Councilmember Guerin commented that frontage roads has been studied and talked about. There is a frontage road from Leucadia Boulevard to La Costa Boulevard in Encinitas, and our citizens are furious about that frontage road. They don't want more traffic on local frontage roads. Someone needs to explore the suggestion of frontage roads with the people who actually live and work in the area.

Mr. Printz explained that there is room to add frontage roads on the freeway rather than adding more freeway lanes. That way there would not be an invasion of private property. He said that the *TransNet Extension* is in trouble because people don't see anything new and they feel that past dollars from *TransNet* have not been well spent.

Mr. Orso Delgado stated that Caltrans is building additional new lanes within the freeway median. They are also trying to connect all of the arterial lanes within the corridor. They

have looked at high-occupancy-vehicle (HOV) versus collective distributor systems. One problem is the area topography and local streets that are not connected.

On another matter, Mr. Orso Delgado stated that Caltrans has been gathering data on the Interstate 15 express lanes, and the numbers indicate that 12,000 vehicles use the HOV lanes northbound on weekends and 6,000 vehicles in the southbound direction. Therefore, Caltrans will be recommending that the HOV lanes be used in the northbound direction on weekends from now on. Caltrans hopes to make a formal report at the March 5 meeting.

Action: The Transportation Committee accepted this report.

10. UPCOMING MEETINGS

The next meeting of the Transportation Committee is scheduled for March 5, 2004.

11. ADJOURNMENT

Chair Kellejian adjourned the meeting at 12:00 Noon.

Attachment: Attendance Sheet

**CONFIRMED ATTENDANCE
SANDAG TRANSPORTATION COMMITTEE MEETING
FEBRUARY 20, 2004**

GEOGRAPHICAL AREA/ORGANIZATION	JURISDICTION	NAME	MEMBER/ALTERNATE	ATTENDING	COMMENTS
North County Coastal	City of Solana Beach	Joe Kellejian (Chair)	Member	Yes	
	City of Encinitas	Christy Guerin	Alternate	Yes	
North County Inland	City of Poway	Mickey Cafagna	Member	Yes	
	City of San Marcos	Corky Smith	Alternate	Yes	
East County	City of Santee	Jack Dale	Member	Yes	
	City of Santee	Hal Ryan	Alternate	No	
South County	City of Chula Vista	Jerry Rindone	Member	Yes	
	City of Coronado	Phil Monroe	Alternate	Yes	
City of San Diego	----	Dick Murphy (Vice Chair)	Member	No	
	----	Jim Madaffer	Alternate	Yes	
County of San Diego	----	Ron Roberts	Member	No	
	----	Dianne Jacob	Alternate	No	
	----	Bill Horn	Alternate	Yes	
Metropolitan Transit Development Board	City of Poway	Bob Emery	Member	Yes	
	MTDB	Leon Williams	Alternate	Yes	
North County Transit Development Board	City of Vista	Judy Ritter	Member	Yes	
	City of Oceanside	Jack Feller	Alternate	Yes	
	City of Del Mar	Dave Druker	Alternate	No	
San Diego County Regional Airport Authority	City of Oceanside	Terry Johnson	Member	No	
	City of Lemon Grove	Mary Sessom	Alternate	Yes	
ADVISORY/LIAISON Caltrans	----	Pedro Orso-Delgado	Member	Yes	
	—	Bill Figge	Alternate	No	